

Name of Journal: *World Journal of Clinical Cases*

ESPS Manuscript NO: 22263

Manuscript Type: EDITORIAL

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

We thank the reviewers for their thoughtful review of our paper. We agree with the reviewers comments and attempted to address each of them in the manuscript.

- 1) The authors are describing and discussing a specific breath-counting meditation technique. I think the manuscript focuses on a very interesting topic, namely the connection between meditation on physically and mental well-being.
 - a. We are thoughtful for your interests in our work.
- 2) In general I think the manuscript is well written and easy to follow.
 - a. Thanks for your comment
- 3) Formally, the authors should check their figure, at least in the doc version it text is cut off.
 - a. We revised the figure to reflect this comment
- 4) Also, the reference list is inconsistent, some references don't list the title of the cited paper while others do. Please check.
 - a. We have fixed the references to reflect this comment
- 5) Regarding the content of the manuscript I am a bit ambivalent, not because I have a strongly different opinion, but rather because the paper reads a bit like an advertisement for SKY. I think all arguments are convincing, but the way everything is presented, it seems somehow incoherent, what the rationale actually is. The manuscript appears to promote SKY as better than other meditation or more specifically other breath-counting techniques. This focus on SKY is not really clear. The authors claim that breath counting is easier due to the guide wire, but is there also supporting data? Is SKY better than other breath counting techniques? For me this focus on SKY is confusing. I would appreciate justification for it or a less focused approach.
 - a. We have revised the paper to focus less on SKY and more on breathing based meditation in general. We agree that more data are needed to compare SKY to other breath counting techniques and decided to remove this statement since we do not have data to support this statement. We are in the process of evaluating this aspect of SKY in a controlled study at multiple sites.
- 6) Thanks for all of your comments as we know that your review greatly improved



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

the readability of this editorial.

Regards

Dr. Robert Carter

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Robert Carter', with a long horizontal stroke extending to the right.