

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 29828

Title: Strategies to tackle the challenges of external beam radiotherapy for liver tumors

Reviewer's code: 00032726

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2016-08-29 23:16

Date reviewed: 2016-09-10 11:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Nowadays, liver cancer has become a difficult problem in the world. Operation sometimes cannot work efficiently because of various reasons. Other kind of treatment which can replace operation are inevitable. Radiotherapy, a kind of potential treatment, may play its role with the development of hardware and software. However, in clinical practice, using radiotherapy faces lots of problems and difficulties, as it mentioned in this article. So this review which provides information for the practical implementation is of immense value. Although this study promotes us to think deeply about how to take advantage of radiotherapy, there are several flaws or questions that should be addressed before further consideration. (1) The table should be created to intuitively show the theme which is a summary of hepatocellular carcinoma radiotherapy studies. The table is too complicated. (2) I personally recommend to merge those three figures into one.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 29828

Title: Strategies to tackle the challenges of external beam radiotherapy for liver tumors

Reviewer's code: 00058381

Reviewer's country: Austria

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2016-08-29 23:16

Date reviewed: 2016-10-24 02:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Major Comment: According to the ESPS (and to the reviewer invitation by e-mail) this manuscript is considered for the World Journal of Hepatology. However, in their article (page 1 and page 4), the authors write that it is intended for the World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology. Of course, the World Journal of Radiology is also an option. Minor Comments: Page 5, second sentence: "...the estimated numbers of cases of colorectal cancer, primary liver, and intrahepatic bile duct cancers will be 132,700 and 35,660, respectively, in 2015." One number is missing here ("estimated numbers of cases of colorectal cancer, primary liver, and intrahepatic bile duct cancers" -> three numbers) and it would be better, in this context, to speak of colorectal liver metastases rather than of "colorectal cancer". Page 11, last paragraph, fifth sentence: "...number of fraction are low" -> please correct this part of the sentence.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 29828

Title: Strategies to tackle the challenges of external beam radiotherapy for liver tumors

Reviewer's code: 01560036

Reviewer's country: Russia

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2016-08-29 23:16

Date reviewed: 2016-10-24 16:07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Nice and useful review

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 29828

Title: Strategies to tackle the challenges of external beam radiotherapy for liver tumors

Reviewer's code: 00182276

Reviewer's country: Hungary

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2016-08-29 23:16

Date reviewed: 2016-10-31 01:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is a very clear overview about radiotherapy of the liver primary and secondary malignancies. There are listed gating techniques. I guess that counting the future remnant liver capacity according to surgical planning the PTV could remain a bit larger. So the target will be always in the irradiated volume. The liver can recover very well within very short period. There are a few correction remained in the manuscript. Following careful minor revision I highly recommend for publication.