

32550-Answering Reviewers

Name of journal: World Journal of Diabetes

ESPS manuscript NO: 32550

Title: Comprehensive review of long term weight loss strategies in people with and without type 2 diabetes

Reviewer's code: 02446593

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Peter Clifton has written a review of long term weight loss strategies in people with and without diabetes. The review is generally good and is on a topic that is likely to be of interest to readers of the WJD. A few minor corrections and additions will make it suitable for publication: 1. The entire manuscript should be reviewed for minor spelling and grammatical errors and these should be corrected. For example, in the first line after "Observation Cohorts", the numbers 1 and 11 are used for the Nurses health study. These should be 1 and 2 or I and II. On the next page it should be "totally clear" instead of "total clear". National Weight control registry instead of Nation weight control register. And so on. 2. At the end of the paragraph about "Issues for Weight Loss and Maintenance", please add a line saying "it should be noted that these are associations and are not necessarily causally related" or some such wording. 3. On Page 6, the sentence "suggesting the Atkins diet is not a useful diet.." should be deleted. It is by no means clear that the minimal LDL elevations are associated with any change in CVD outcomes. 4. On page 10, para 1, the words artificially sweetened are repeated. 5. In the dairy section, add the fact that many dairy interventions used low fat or skim milk or do not identify fat content of milk, but recent evidence indicates that whole fat milk may be healthier and this fact should be noted and referenced. 6. At the end of para 1 on page 14, the last sentence has a double negative in it. 7. In the Atkins and South Beach section, the sentence about LDL levels should say there is "some theoretical concern" instead of "some concern". 8. After the microbiome section, it will be good to add a conclusion paragraph summarizing the results of this review and pointing out that the question of optimal weight loss strategies remains largely unresolved and many interventions work to some extent, but none work in all patients. It is possible that genotyping will contribute to more targeted interventions in the future. Or some such sentence.

RESPONSE

Errors have been corrected. I have not deleted the sentence requested but I have toned it down a bit. Although the LDL rise in the Atkins diets hasn't been proven to adversely affect CVD there are no trials looking at this changes in LDL under other circumstances are predictive of CVD risk. I have added data on FMD which is related to CVD risk. I have noted that most of the interventions with dairy were probably low fat as fat intake was the same in both intervention and control diets. I don't believe there is convincing evidence that full fat dairy is healthier and the data on dairy and CVD is pretty neutral (eg Alexander 2016). The Dutch cohorts -Rotterdam and EPIC have opposite conclusions. I think the data currently doesn't support any positive statements.

"Theoretical" add to concerns in the Atkins/South Beach section.

Conclusions added at the end

Weight loss occurs with many different diets and there is no clear conclusions on the optimal diet apart from one which the individual can stick to long term. Whether phenotyping (eg degree of insulin resistance) or genotyping will help diet choice is not clear.

Reviewer's code: 02459617

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Clifton et al. reviewed and summarized the long term weight loss strategies in people with and without type 2 diabetes. This is an interesting and well organized manuscript. However, there are several concerns. (1) The author should make a table to summarize the conclusions of different strategies. (2) The use of abbreviations was not normative. The abbreviations should be used when and after the term appeared at the first time. For example, PUFA on page 4; CHO on page 5. (3) This manuscript should be carefully checked for typos.

RESPONSE

Table added to remove some of the details from the text and add conclusions. Typos corrected and abbreviations added



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

Reviewer's code: 02446542

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review present the long term weight loss strategies in people with and without type 2 diabetes. Although the presented data is interesting the total manuscript is "wordy". Is necessary for the author to present the key data from the clinical studies in tables in order to give to the reader a meaningful message. Moreover, there are some typos in the manuscript which need to be corrected

RESPONSE

Tables added with key data removed from text and added to the tables . Typos corrected

Reviewer's code: 02810791

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Prof. P Clifton provides a complete review on the long-term effects of diet, in people without or with diabetes. The use of different dietary interventions and the long-term persistence of such interventions is discussed in detail. The manuscript is sometimes not easy to read, as the discussion of the weight loss studies presented here is associated to the data of the main study findings. Some effort to render the manuscript more "narrative" would be welcome. Also, as the author is a leading figure in the field of weight management, it would be interesting for the reader to find a conclusive paragraph including some "personal feeling" of the authors to show the way forward. I would also suggest the addition of a table summarizing the key findings of the dietary studies reviewed within the manuscript. Beside these general comments, I would just add a few editing observations that might improve the manuscript. - Please separate running title from Author name. - Page 5 : replace " CHO " with "carbohydrate" Some abbreviations are used without definition. Although sometimes clear to the reader, I believe defining abbreviation would be helpful. - Page 8: please define PAI-1 - Page 10: please define RCT - Page 11: please define QR - Page 14: please define IQR - Page 17: please define RYGB A final proofreading would be welcome: e.g., - page 10 line 4; - page 13, after ref 68: There were many benefits were seen - page 14: No benefit was unfortunately not seen I would suggest the addition of a table summarizing the key findings of the dietary studies reviewed within the manuscript.

RESPONSE

Abbreviations added, Table added. Typos corrected



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

Reviewer's code: 02446558

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very comprehensive review study of long term weight loss strategies in people with and without type 2 diabetes. This is a very good designed and written study. I believe that adding some tables or figures will make it easier to follow and also more attractive to the readers. In addition, having the author's final conclusion at the end, will help to clarify the aim of the study.

RESPONSE

Tables added. Conclusions added