

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 32644

Title: The radiological response and inflammation scores predict tumor recurrence in patients treated with transarterial chemoembolization before liver transplantation

Reviewer's code: 00051373

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2017-01-19

Date reviewed: 2017-01-19

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a retrospective study to investigate the prognostic value of radiological response after transarterial chemoembolization (TACE) and inflammatory markers in patients affected by hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC) awaiting liver transplantation (LT). Although this manuscript is written so well, the "before" and "after" to be confuse between the main title and running title.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 32644

Title: The radiological response and inflammation scores predict tumor recurrence in patients treated with transarterial chemoembolization before liver transplantation

Reviewer's code: 03656588

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2017-01-19

Date reviewed: 2017-01-20

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1) The retrospective study was the first of its kind to look at the combination of inflammatory markers and tumor radiological response as competitive risk factors using multivariate analysis. The regression analysis of risk factors for post-LT recurrence was performed taking in account radiological (morphological and response to therapy) and biological variables (AFP, NLR and PLR, including their slopes) at two well-defined time-points (before starting TACE therapy and immediately before LT). The results is reliable and convincing, and better reference value to predict the tumor recurrence and allow a proper selection of TACE-treated candidates for LT. 2) I suggest that the manuscript can be published in the form of Retrospective Cohort Study in World J Gastroenterol.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 32644

Title: The radiological response and inflammation scores predict tumor recurrence in patients treated with transarterial chemoembolization before liver transplantation

Reviewer's code: 02451447

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2017-01-19

Date reviewed: 2017-01-22

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors analyzed 70 HCC patients treated by TACE prior to LT including radiological response, histological necrosis and platelet-to-lymphocyte ratio indexes. The authors concluded that radiological response and inflammatory markers are predictive of tumor recurrence and allow a proper selection of TACE-treated candidates for LT. The study is well designed and the data are convincing.