



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 35031

Title: Dramatic response of hepatitis C patients chronically infected with Hepatitis C virus genotype 3 to Sofosbuvir based therapies in Punjab, Pakistan: A prospective study

Reviewer's code: 02524274

Reviewer's country: Reviewer_Country

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2017-07-12

Date reviewed: 2017-07-20

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the manuscript entitled 'Dramatic response of Hepatitis C patients chronically infected with HCV genotype 3 to Sofosbuvir based therapies in Punjab, Pakistan: A prospective study', the authors carried out a prospective study to assess the efficacy and safety of sofosbuvir based therapies for the patients with genotype 3. Although this study seems well designed and the results are relevant to clinical practice, there are several concerns and these should be properly addressed. Major comments 1. The authors compared the SVR rates between 1st group and 2nd group. Then, why did authors divide two categories by 40 years. The mean age of patients included this study was 48 years. 2. Relapse rate of the patients with more than 40 years was relatively high in 2nd group. The author should mention the reason of high relapse rate. 3. Both groups included ribavirin, so the authors should analyze adherence of ribavirin dose. Generally, in case with RBV based regimen SVR rate and relapse rate depend on their



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

adherence. How did the adherence of ribavirin influence to SVR rate? 4. This study was a prospective study. The authors should describe registration number.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 35031

Title: Dramatic response of hepatitis C patients chronically infected with Hepatitis C virus genotype 3 to Sofosbuvir based therapies in Punjab, Pakistan: A prospective study

Reviewer's code: 00053709

Reviewer's country: Pakistan

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2017-07-12

Date reviewed: 2017-07-23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript has several syntax errors, which should be removed before the publication. The article should be revised accordingly: 1. Title: The running title should be modified as "Response of Sofosbuvir in Pakistani HCV patients", as the study is focused on response rate in Punjab, (Pakisatni) population. 2. Abstract: Acceptable, but the section describing results should be more precise. 3. Introduction: Latest reference regarding HCV in Pakistan especially in Punjab region should be added, the references are of 2008-2014 with no specific reference to Punjab. The rational of the study is not clearly explained. 4. Materials and Methods: Well explained. 5. Results: well described. 6. Discussion: Results were adequately interpreted but need to be discussed also in contest of latest data coming from Pakistan in fact from the same city regarding the increasing number of relapse cases of HCV 3 genotype patients treated with this combination of regime i.e. Wahid et al., 2017. Rising relapse rate in hepatitis C virus type



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

3a-infected patients against sofosbuvir and ribavirin combination therapy: a Pakistani experience. *Eur J Gastroenterol Hepatol.* 2017 Aug;29(8):979-980. doi: 10.1097/MEG.0000000000000895. Similarly, Studies from Pakistan supporting this regime should also be discussed i.e., Azam et al., 2017. Initial results of efficacy and safety of Sofosbuvir among Pakistani Population: A real life trial - Hepatitis Eradication Accuracy Trial of Sofosbuvir (HEATS). *Pak J Med Sci.* 2017 Jan-Feb;33(1):48-52. doi: 10.12669/pjms.331.12352. Suggestions: Accepted after Minor revision.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 35031

Title: Dramatic response of hepatitis C patients chronically infected with Hepatitis C virus genotype 3 to Sofosbuvir based therapies in Punjab, Pakistan: A prospective study

Reviewer's code: 00004847

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2017-07-12

Date reviewed: 2017-07-26

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors evaluated the efficacy and safety of sofosbuvir plus ribavirin in the treatment of HCV genotype 3 in Pakistan. The results are impressive, although the results are in sharp contrast to the data published around the world and that have generated the international guidelines that consider genotype 3 difficult to treat. The EASL and AASLD guidelines state that "sofosbuvir plus ribavirin is a suboptimal treatment and not be used". Currently, in the Western world the sofosbuvir + ribavirin regime is not more used to treat genotype 3. The authors, in the discussion, have completely ignored the results of the literature and have not discussed their results in relation to the data reported world wide and what is state in the international guidelines. The data of this study seem to be generated by a particular local susceptibility of genotype 3 and may have a relevance in Pakistan.