

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 35491

Title: Surgically treated diaphragmatic perforation after radiofrequency ablation for hepatocellular carcinoma.

Reviewer's code: 03408355

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Li-Jun Cui

Date sent for review: 2017-08-08

Date reviewed: 2017-08-08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper focused on the surgical treatment for diaphragmatic perforation after radiofrequency ablation for hepatocellular carcinoma. However, only 6 patients were enrolled, which could not provide sufficient information. Thus, this paper may be more appropriate for being published as a case report or a letter. Previous reports on this topic may be summarized and listed in a table. Several language mistakes were found in the paper.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 35491

Title: Surgically treated diaphragmatic perforation after radiofrequency ablation for hepatocellular carcinoma.

Reviewer's code: 03656588

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Li-Jun Cui

Date sent for review: 2017-08-08

Date reviewed: 2017-08-10

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1) The mechanism of diaphragm perforation after RFA has not been clarified. The case reports were analyzed to describe the causative factors , clinical presentation, diagnosis, and treatment of the diaphragm perforation. The results were truth and reliable. It is more important clinical value to guide the early diagnosis and clinical treatment of the diaphragm perforation after RFA. 2) I suggest that the manuscript can be published in the form of retrospective study in World J Gastrointestinal Surgery.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 35491

Title: Surgically treated diaphragmatic perforation after radiofrequency ablation for hepatocellular carcinoma.

Reviewer's code: 00722239

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Li-Jun Cui

Date sent for review: 2017-08-16

Date reviewed: 2017-08-19

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors have reported 6 cases of diaphragm perforation after RFA. The study is well designed and the manuscript is well-written. Although this study treated small number series and lack the novel findings, the results and discussion would contribute to the elucidation of the mechanism of diaphragm perforation after RFA. If pathological findings of the perforated diaphragm are available, please present it.