

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 36358

Title: Advances and Challenges in Laparoscopic Surgery in the management of Hepatocellular Carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 03656588

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Li-Jun Cui

Date sent for review: 2017-09-21

Date reviewed: 2017-09-22

Review time: 1 Day

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1) The authors reviewed the present the current knowledge around laparoscopic hepatectomy, with a special interest on the indications, general principles and technique, as well as its' envisioned future. It is better understanding the current status and advances in laparoscopic hepatectomy. 2) The review is very too long narration involved in many aspects . The focus is not outstanding. The main narration should focus on the "Advances and Challenges in Laparoscopic Surgery in the management of HCC", not in operating time, safety, learning curve, cost etc. 3) The figure is too nebulous and need to be changed 4) I suggest that the manuscript need be further condensed and the focus is outstanding .

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 36358

Title: Advances and Challenges in Laparoscopic Surgery in the management of Hepatocellular Carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 00053419

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Li-Jun Cui

Date sent for review: 2017-09-21

Date reviewed: 2017-10-02

Review time: 11 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors provide a review of an interesting topic. The application of a laparoscopic approach to the treatment of HCC patients is an open question that offer an alternative therapeutic intervention but still many challenging issues remain to be addressed. The overall structure of the manuscript is appropriate, the main aspects have been nicely highlighted with references to the most relevant studies currently available. The review might be a good starting point to start productive discussions on this issue. I would recommend to avoid detailed descriptions of very specific technical aspects for an easy reading and to allow the reader to recognise the most relevant and critical points.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 36358

Title: Advances and Challenges in Laparoscopic Surgery in the management of Hepatocellular Carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 00052899

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Li-Jun Cui

Date sent for review: 2017-09-21

Date reviewed: 2017-10-07

Review time: 15 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this present review, the authors summarized the general principles, current status and future prospects of laparoscopic liver resection for hepatocellular carcinoma. There were two problems in the manuscript. First, indications for surgical resection for HCC could be introduced briefly according to figure 1. Second, the general principles of laparoscopic liver resection should be refined considering the core aim of the review.