Baishideng Publishing Group

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology
Manuscript NO: 36497
Title: Vitamin D in Esophageal Cancer: Is there a role for Chemoprevention?
Reviewer's code: 00182114
Reviewer's country: Japan
Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong
Date sent for review: 2017-10-09
Date reviewed: 2017-10-14
Review time: 4 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is the systemic review which has examined the relationship between esophageal neoplasia risk and vitamin D exposures; author present the most comprehensive overview of available evidence to date by including all major personal, environmental, and genetic factors related to vitamin D. While vitamin D has generally been shown to be protective for most other cancers, author found serum 25(OH)D3 levels appear to be associated with higher risk of ESCC and EAC. Moreover, author concluded VDR expression is increased in BE as compared to EAC or normal squamous epithelium. I ask some questions to author. 1.I think SCC is due to tobacco and alcohol, ADC is due to GERD. There is a etiological difference between ADC and SCC. But author found serum 25(OH)D3 levels appear to be associated with higher risk of ESCC and EAC. Please comment serum 25(OH)D3 levels appear to be associated with higher risk of ESCC and EAC. 2. Author concluded VDR expression is increased in BE as compared to EAC or

Baishideng Publishing Group

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

normal squamous epithelium. Please tell me the reason why VDR expression is increased in BE as compared to EAC or normal squamous epithelium.

Baishideng Publishing Group

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology
Manuscript NO: 36497
Title: Vitamin D in Esophageal Cancer: Is there a role for Chemoprevention?
Reviewer's code: 03086186
Reviewer's country: Taiwan
Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong
Date sent for review: 2017-10-20
Date reviewed: 2017-10-27
Review time: 7 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[Y] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dr. Rouphael and the other authors made a comprehensive review of the effects of vitamin D on esophageal cancer and the precursor lesions. Despite solid conclusions regarding the chemopreventive role of vitamin D in esophageal cancer cannot be made, and problems remained regarding quantification of dietary vitamin D intake and sunlight, this review can still provide readers a deep insight into the topic. In addition, authors proposed future studies in the field, including prospective studies with accurate measurement of vitamin D status before chemoprevention with vitamin D, studies looking at the incidence of esophageal cancer in patients with pre-cancerous lesions with vitamin D supplementation. I think the review is suitable for publication in the Journal.

Baishideng Publishing Group

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology
Manuscript NO: 36497
Title: Vitamin D in Esophageal Cancer: Is there a role for Chemoprevention?
Reviewer's code: 00052339
Reviewer's country: Japan
Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong
Date sent for review: 2017-10-20
Date reviewed: 2017-10-28
Review time: 7 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[Y] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[Y] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Vitamin D in Esophageal Cancer: Is there a role for Chemoprevention? Carol Rouphael et al. This review is not meta-analysis but just summary of the papers. The paper presented here showed the results of the correlation between Vitamin D and esophageal cancer analyzed by different methods. The 4 papers analyzed the correlation by using serum Vitamin D level, other 3 papers adopted the dietary intake, other 2 papers showed the results of ultraviolet B radiation. In addition, with genetic analysis there were two approaches such as Vitamin D receptor expression (3 papers) and Vitamin D receptor gene polymorphisms (2 papers). Thus, the different analytical methods were reviewed, and it was uncertain that the results obtained by these different methods were chemo-preventive or suppressive of development of esophageal cancer. If this manuscript may be acceptable for publication the author should review much more papers to obtain the conclusion about chemo-preventive effects of Vitamin D signaling

Baishideng Publishing Group

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

because of many different approaches adopted by the authors.