

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 36795

Title: Obese Children With Fatty Liver: Between Reality and Disease Mongering.

Reviewer's code: 02451157

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Ke Chen

Date sent for review: 2017-10-24

Date reviewed: 2017-10-27

Review time: 2 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper indicates that the progression during childhood is not well defined. The pharmacological interventions is mongering. It's quite an interesting point of view of authors to point out that the therapeutic strategy should be more aware and careful when treating children with NAFLD. The authors also demonstrate an important concept that it appears more important to focus on the systemic impact of obesity in general rather than on the fatty liver. This minireview article is worth publishing.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 36795

Title: Obese Children With Fatty Liver: Between Reality and Disease Mongering.

Reviewer's code: 03402733

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ke Chen

Date sent for review: 2017-10-24

Date reviewed: 2017-10-29

Review time: 5 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Francia P. et al. performed a short narrative review for pediatric NAFLD. This review manuscript encompasses an interesting topic and may be worthwhile publishing, however it needs a minor revision, scientific and stylistic. Major comments 1. The abstract has to be rewritten to tell the specific goal of the review and major conclusions made. Minor comments 2. Authors use the term "Feldstein's series". It is difficult to identify it, because authors referred 3 manuscripts reported by Feldstein AE 3. Reference 10; Feldstein A or Feldstein AE? 4. Please reconsider to use "report" instead of "paper".

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 36795

Title: Obese Children With Fatty Liver: Between Reality and Disease Mongering.

Reviewer's code: 03022389

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Ke Chen

Date sent for review: 2017-10-24

Date reviewed: 2017-11-06

Review time: 12 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript, the authors discuss the limited nature of existing data on negative outcomes in pediatric NAFLD. They argue that insufficient evidence exists to conclude that NAFLD in children poses a major health risk and express concern that researchers, clinicians, and pharmaceutical companies may overstate these risks to the detriment (or at least absence of benefit) of patients. The topic is interesting and highly relevant, and the authors make good points that should be considered by those working in the field. There are, however, some areas of concern that detract from the manuscript's message. These concerns are described in the attached document and include issues with clarity, insufficient supporting evidence, and overly subjective tone.