



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 37295

Title: Incidence of Hepatocellular Carcinoma in Patients With Chronic Liver Disease Due to Hepatitis B or C and Coinfected with the Human Immunodeficiency Virus: a retrospective cohort study

Reviewer's code: 03262379

Reviewer's country: Iran

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2017-11-29

Date reviewed: 2017-12-04

Review time: 5 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Hello, I reviewed the manuscript entitled "Incidence of Hepatocellular Carcinoma in Patients With Chronic Liver Disease Due to Hepatitis B or C and Coinfected with the Human Immunodeficiency Virus: a retrospective cohort study". The authors looked for the impact of HIV infection on development of HCC in patients with viral hepatitis. They found no association between development of HCC and HIV infection in these patients. This study is presenting interesting findings and I suggest few amendments: 1. I suggest to exclude the data for survival of patients from the last part of results and also the part from discussion given it is unrelated to the main aim of the study. 2. Can authors present how treatment of HBV or HCV and also sustained response to treatments impacted the HCC development in this study? 3. It is important to



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

emphasize that this study was conducted on patients referred to tertiary care center. 4. Patients with hepatitis B routinely stratified based on clinical and laboratory findings in groups of patients with active, inactive and etc needing a range of managements such as antiviral therapies. It is why I guess just a proportion of patient without HIV underwent antiviral therapy while patients with HIV should be treated with common antiviral therapies of both infection and so most of them were actively treated. I suggest authors to present the clinical presentation of patients with hepatitis B in both group if the data available. Regards



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 37295

Title: Incidence of Hepatocellular Carcinoma in Patients With Chronic Liver Disease Due to Hepatitis B or C and Coinfected with the Human Immunodeficiency Virus: a retrospective cohort study

Reviewer's code: 00503560

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2017-11-29

Date reviewed: 2017-12-05

Review time: 6 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript by Patrícia dos Santos Marcon and colleagues investigated the incidence of HCC in HBV or HCV infected patients with or without HIV infection. They concluded that the presence of HIV coinfection in chronic liver disease due to HBV or HCV showed no relation to the increase of HCC incidence. The manuscript is generally well-written, the statistical analysis is good, and the purpose of the study is clinically important. Several comments are described below. 1) As is well known, the incidence of HCC is different among patients infected with HBV and HCV. Therefore, the authors should compare the incidence between HIV/HCV coinfecting patients vs. HCV mono-infected patients, and HIV/HBV coinfecting patients vs. HBV mono-infected patients. In this cohort, the number of HBV infected patients is low. The authors should



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

show the results of subanalyses only in HCV infected patients with or without HIV infection. If impossible, the authors should describe regarding that as a limitation. 2) As is well known, the elimination of HCV and the suppression of HBV can reduce the incidence of HCC. Therefore, the authors should consider this and carry out the present analyses. The authors should mention this in the discussion. 3) In the note of Table 4, the authors should correct "CHC=Hepatocellular carcinoma" to "HCC=Hepatocellular carcinoma".