

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 37608

**Title:** NOD2- and disease-specific gene expression profiles of peripheral blood mononuclear cells from Crohn's disease patients

**Reviewer's code:** 00503587

**Reviewer's country:** New Zealand

**Science editor:** Xue-Jiao Wang

**Date sent for review:** 2018-01-03

**Date reviewed:** 2018-01-06

**Review time:** 3 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This work examines the gene profiles of PBMC in individuals with and without CD

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS**

1. There are a number of errors of English language word usage/grammar that all need correction
2. The authors should revise the term "CD patients" to read "patients with CD" as per various international guidelines
3. In the INTRODUCTION, the authors refer to NOD2 and CD. This sentence should be revised to be more clear and precise. NOD2 is but one of the at risk genes/NOD2 is a risk factor in Caucasian populations predominantly.
4. The word regime is used incorrectly: this should be correct to the word "regimen"
5. The manuscript includes a combined Results/Discussion section, which is not usual for the journal
6. If the criteria for inclusion was clinical remission (CDAI <150) why was one patient included who did not fit that specific criterion?
7. Whilst the CDAI score may include a presence/absence of



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

symptoms, it may not indicate disease activity. Did the group of patients with CD who had low CDAI scores also have normal CRP (or calprotectin or other inflammatory markers)? 8. Can the authors be sure that the drug exposures did not affect the gene profiles of interest? 9. As stated vitamin D is important in the context of IBD, and vitamin D was used in the ex vivo work. What was the vitamin D status of the subjects prior to collection of PBMC? 10. In TABLE 2 we are told of the maximum upregulation. One assumes that this fold difference relates to just one of the genes of interest (the one with maximal change). The other genes may have or may not have substantially different fold difference. Hence this is not that helpful 11. TABLE 4 lists the disease and other defining characteristics for the 16 subjects with CD. A number of the subjects are listed to have multiple disease locations (e.g. L1 L2 L3). These three patterns should be mutually exclusive - this should be corrected 12. How long were cells exposed to vitamin D? Figure 1 says 22 hours. Table S2 says 26 hours. This is not clear

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 37608

**Title:** NOD2- and disease-specific gene expression profiles of peripheral blood mononuclear cells from Crohn's disease patients

**Reviewer's code:** 02439579

**Reviewer's country:** China

**Science editor:** Xue-Jiao Wang

**Date sent for review:** 2018-01-07

**Date reviewed:** 2018-01-12

**Review time:** 5 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The study characterized different gene expression profiles of peripheral blood mononuclear cells in CD and healthy controls correlating to the NOD2 mutation status. The research design is reasonable and the conclusion is credible. It helps us to understand the role of NOD2 mutation in the Pathophysiology in CD.

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 37608

**Title:** NOD2- and disease-specific gene expression profiles of peripheral blood mononuclear cells from Crohn's disease patients

**Reviewer's code:** 03476277

**Reviewer's country:** Portugal

**Science editor:** Xue-Jiao Wang

**Date sent for review:** 2018-01-03

**Date reviewed:** 2018-01-15

**Review time:** 12 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors analyzed disease-specific gene expression profiles of peripheral blood mononuclear cells (PBMCs) of Crohn's disease (CD) patients in clinical remission. They identified CLEC5A and LYZ as CD- and NOD2-associated genes of PBMCs. I think this may be an interesting finding for future investigations but due to the small number of patients enrolled no conclusions can be made. Furthermore, this study issue is basic science thus I think it would better fit in a journal dedicated to that.