

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 37881

Title: Fecal Microbial Dysbiosis in Chinese Patients with Inflammatory Bowel Disease.

Reviewer's code: 00035901

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Li Ma

Date sent for review: 2018-01-23

Date reviewed: 2018-01-31

Review time: 8 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors demonstrated the changes in microbiota of patients with IBD determined by 16S rDNA V4 sequencing of fecal samples. The present study was well organized and well investigated, and will give us an information of Chinese patients. To improve the quality of this paper, the authors should revise it according to the following suggestions; 1) The DNA extraction method is important to analyze. The author should show the precise protocol of CTAB/SDS method used in the present study. 2) The authors should indicate the limitation of this method using a feces sample. In addition, the sample number is very small in the present study. 3) Compared to the feces sample, recent investigation showed the more significant role of mucosa-associated microbiota in IBD (Nishino K et al. J Gastroenterology 2017, Aug 29, Pub ahead).

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 37539 (37881)

Title: Fecal Microbial Dysbiosis in Chinese Patients with Inflammatory Bowel Disease

Reviewer's code: 01047558

Reviewer's country: Tunisia

Science editor: Li Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-12-25

Date reviewed: 2018-01-09

Review time: 14 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript "Fecal Microbial Dysbiosis in Chinese Patients with Inflammatory Bowel Disease" analyze the fecal microbiota in Chinese patients with inflammatory bowel disease. Comments: The results of this study must be discussed - Community richness with chao indices was significantly different in both CD and UC than in normal controls. But this result was not confirmed by the observed species and ace indices. We must explain this in discussion. - Bacteroidetes in the active Crohn's disease (CD) group was significantly lower than that in the inactive CD group, and it showed a negative correlation with Crohn's disease activity index (CDAI). In this study only 4 patients were inactive this number is low to have a conclusion furthermore no significant difference was noted between patients with mild and moderate CD. So we cannot conclude anything. A critical analysis in the discussion must be made.