



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 38556

Title: Efficacy and safety of endoscopic submucosal tunnel dissection for superficial esophageal squamous cell carcinoma and precancerous lesions

Reviewer's code: 02441437

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-03-19

Date reviewed: 2018-03-23

Review time: 4 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I have some considerations and questions - There have been changes in the way ESTD is performed over time (eg. advices, current type, use of CO2) - What are the reasons for the high number of R0 resection failures. (12 in the vertical margin and 3 in the lateral margin). - Discuss about the macroscopic aspects and lymphovascular invasion. - It is necessary to discuss the incidence of infections. Is the prophylactic antibiotic necessary? Should the protection of the airways be done in all cases?



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 38556

Title: Efficacy and safety of endoscopic submucosal tunnel dissection for superficial esophageal squamous cell carcinoma and precancerous lesions

Reviewer’s code: 00071054

Reviewer’s country: Japan

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-03-27

Date reviewed: 2018-04-02

Review time: 6 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors sought to assess the efficacy and safety of endoscopic submucosal tunnel dissection (ESTD) in treating superficial esophageal squamous cell carcinoma and precancerous lesion in a relatively large sample. They concluded that this technique was effective and safe, with relatively high en bloc and complete resection rates, as well as low bleeding and perforation rates; however, the incidence of postoperative stricture and positive margin was high. I have some comments as follows. 1. High complete resection rate and high positive margin rate was contradictory. 2. There were no data on the pathological discordance between the pre- and post-ESTD specimens in the Abstract; therefore, the conclusions should be modified (page 2, line 17-19). 3. Continuous variables should be rounded to the first decimal place. 4. The average hospitalization expense should be converted into dollars. 5. Further management for 10 patients with



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

obstinate stricture should be described (page 12, line 1-2). 6. Gender difference was of no importance in this study (page 13, line 18-20). 7. The bleeding rate of 8.04% in this study was not low compared with that of ESD in the previous studies (0%-6%). Please specify the reason why the authors considered ESTD as a safe treatment method for these diseases (page 14, line 17-21).