Baishideng Publishing Group

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
Manuscript NO: 38580
Title: Microbiota modification by probiotic supplementation reduces colon cancer-associated colitis in mice
Reviewer's code: 01557050
Reviewer's country: Japan
Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong
Date sent for review: 2018-03-17
Date reviewed: 2018-03-22
Review time: 4 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dr. Mendes and Carvalheira, et al reported 'Microbiota modification by probiotic supplementation reduces colon cancer-associated colitis in mice'. The article is well-presented. The reviewer has a minor comment. Comments 1. In Results, page 12, line 6, in Figure 4E, the authors should explain how the authors determine the reduction, and how the authors calculate data for the results in Figure 4E. 2. In Discussion, page 12, line 25-26, please correct mistyping.

Baishideng Publishing Group

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
Manuscript NO: 38580
Title: Microbiota modification by probiotic supplementation reduces colon cancer-associated colitis in mice
Reviewer's code: 00227403
Reviewer's country: Italy
Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong
Date sent for review: 2018-03-17
Date reviewed: 2018-03-25
Review time: 8 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the section abstract each acronym should be explained (see RT-PCR). Considering that the probiotic group presented more tumours of smaller size (<2 mm) (P = 0.0002), could it means that probiotics slow cancer progression instead to reduce cancer development? This issue should be discussed in the section Discussion.

Baishideng Publishing Group

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
Manuscript NO: 38580
Title: Microbiota modification by probiotic supplementation reduces colon cancer-associated colitis in mice
Reviewer's code: 00199586
Reviewer's country: Czech Republic
Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong
Date sent for review: 2018-03-17
Date reviewed: 2018-03-27
Review time: 10 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[Y] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors report an animal study on the effect of probiotic supplementation during the development of an experimental model of colon cancer-associated colitis. Experiment was performed on quite small number of subjects, but message of this study is clear. I agree with the argument, that little is known about the interaction between probiotics, microbiota composition and neoplastic transformation. Author should explain, why they choose Lactobacillus acidophilus, Lactobacillus rhamnosus and Bifidobacterium bifidum mixture for this experiment. Otherwise I support this manuscript for publication.

Baishideng Publishing Group

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
Manuscript NO: 38580
Title: Microbiota modification by probiotic supplementation reduces colon cancer-associated colitis in mice
Reviewer's code: 02567669
Reviewer's country: Germany
Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong
Date sent for review: 2018-03-17
Date reviewed: 2018-03-30
Review time: 13 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very interesting and well written paper which deserves publication in the WJG. Only minor comments: 1. Is the title really correct? Or misleading?Colon cancer-associated colitis or colitis-associated colon cancer? Which is the primary event: 1. colitis leading to 2. colon cancer (if the carcinogen is added) or 1. colon cancer and 2. dextran sulfate associated colitis as the secondary phenomenon? 2. The authors should explain the terms alpha diversity and beta diversity (for the reader not so familiar with these analyses). 3. It is correct that the authors build the bridge to human pathology with coresponding data in CRC or ulcerative colitis. Can they give a suggestion which type of probiotic bacteria are most useful for therapy of inflammatory bowel diseases or for prevention of colorectal cancer (difficult question, I know). 4. Did the authors observe any alteration of mucosal histology near the tumours? Is there a transition zone between

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

only inflamed mucosa and malignant mucosa?