Baishideng Publishing Group

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 38936

Title: Clival metastasis of renal clear cell carcinoma: Case report and literature review

Reviewer's code: 03002093

Reviewer's country: Hungary

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2018-04-21

Date reviewed: 2018-05-04

Review time: 13 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Very good [Y] Grade C: Good [ ] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing [ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Accept (High priority) [ ] Accept (General priority) [Y] Minor revision [ ] Major revision [ ] Rejection	Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous [ ] Onymous Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript: [ ] Advanced [Y] General [ ] No expertise Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Major remarks The following publications can be included in table 1 or discussed (and the last sentence of introduction would be: "…with few cases previously…"): - Gil Salu http://www.revistaneurocirugia.com/en-congresos-xxi-congreso-nacional-sociedad-espanola-47-sesion-oncologa-oncology-3252-metstasis-clival-tarda-de-carcinoma-35900-pdf -

Baishideng Publishing Group

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Zahra doi: 10.1016/j.ijrobp.2014.05.2016 - Patel www.triomeetingposters.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/01/009.pdf - Ouma doi: 10.1016/j.wneu.2017.09.068 - Campbell doi: 10.1594/ecr2010/C-1347 - Santhosh http://oncologypro.esmo.org/content/download/125614/2375060/file/2017-ESMO-Preceptorship-I-O-Participant-Clinical-Case-Discussion-Immunotherapy-Advanced-RCC-Santhosh-Kumar-Devadas.pdf - Neelakantan doi: 10.1016/j.crad.2014.07.010 - Chamoun doi: 10.1227/NEU.0b013e318236a700 It would be useful for authors of further reviews to know the results of gamma knife treatment and the end of follow-up (date of resubmission) in order to calculate the survival. In table 1 (instead of year of reporting) include which was firstly diagnosed, the clival metastasis or the primary RCC (and the interval between them). Minor remarks Typing errors: Fumino, sunitinib, sorafenib, adrenal gland,

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

Baishideng Publishing Group

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 38936

Title: Clival metastasis of renal clear cell carcinoma: Case report and literature review

Reviewer's code: 00123524

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2018-05-18

Date reviewed: 2018-05-21

Review time: 3 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Very good [Y] Grade C: Good [ ] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing [ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Accept (High priority) [ ] Accept (General priority) [ ] Minor revision [Y] Major revision [ ] Rejection	Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous [ ] Onymous Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript: [ ] Advanced [Y] General [ ] No expertise Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting case report about a rare metastasis site for Renal Clear Cell Carcinoma. I have just a few humble suggestions for the authors to improve their manuscript further, as follows. 1. Page 2, Introduction section. Please spell Renal Cell Carcinoma in full before using its abbreviation in the text. Having used the abbreviation

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

within the abstract is not sufficient reason to use it without full spelling the first time it appears within the main text. 2. The overall quality of the English text is good. Nevertheless I would like to recommend that the manuscript be revised by a native English speaker to amend a few details. For instance: P2, introduction section: "Tumors originating from the clivus are rare: chordomas, which are the most frequent tumor of this region…". I believe this sentence could be improved: Tumors originating primarily in the clivus region are very rare. Chordomas, which are the most frequent tumor affecting that region…". 3. Because not all renal cell carcinomas are clear cell carcinomas, the authors should refer specifically to Renal Clear Cell Carcinomas (RCCC) throughout the text and not simply to Renal Cell Carcinomas. See Delahunt & Eble, Clin Lab Med 2005; 25(2):231-246 (https://www.labmed.theclinics.com/article/S0272-2712(05)00007-7/abstract) 4. I would like to suggest the authors to use arrows to show specific important details within figures. 5. Please specify if the literature review encompassed Renal Cell Carcinomas in general or Renal Clear Cell Carcinomas. 6. P7, first paragraph "The possibility of metastatic RCC should be sought when acute cranial neuropathies occurs on a patient presents." This sentence ends abruptly and is not clear, please double-check the intended message. I also believe that instead of the verb "to seek" the authors should use the verb "to consider". 7. In the abstract the authors describe the treatment approach that they used to help the patient. However there is no mention within the main text besides table 1 about details of the treatment of the patient, complications of the treatment and patient outcome. Those pieces of information are very important for the reader because they provide valuable information for clinicians caring for patients with a rare condition. It would be very interesting to inform readers if the patient survived treatment and what is his likely prognosis, if the developed sequelae from tumor/surgery, if the tumor recurred either locally in the clivus or elsewhere in his body. This should be done within

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

the case report section. Additionally and ideally, a new column could be added to table 1 informing readers about the outcome of the management of the patients described in those case reports that were reviewed. 8. Please, transfer the table to a page formatted under landscape mode at the end of the text, in order to increase its readability. 9. Please, avoid using the word gender in the table to refer to biological sex. Gender is really about a social construct and can be different than biological sex. 10. The last paragraph of the discussion section deals with the treatment of RCC. Many of its statements do not have a proper reference. E.g. "The benefit of radiotherapy in the treatment of RCC remains unclear and is not recommended. Stereotactic radiotherapy has been shown to be successful in both reducing local symptoms from tumor bulk and stabilization of the growth of metastatic lesions at both cranial and extracranial sites. " 11. There should be at least a paragraph within the discussion section concerning the prognosis of patients with RCCC in general and in those with metastases including to the central nervous system.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

[Y] No