

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39107

Title: Multiparametric Analysis of Colorectal Cancer Immune Responses

Reviewer's code: 02575643

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-04-10

Date reviewed: 2018-04-10

Review time: 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting review which tries to show the complex heterogeneous inflammatory reaction associated to colorectal cancer. The Authors analyze the currently available methods to determine the degree of inflammatory cells, with the assumption of a probable correlation between inflammatory cells and efficacy of the



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

immunological reaction. In this review they correctly found that different types of lymphocytes and macrophages are present in several cancer regions. Data are disocrdant about the prognostic value of the cancer infiltration by these types of cells. They analyzed several techniques to quantify this infiltrartion of inflammatory-immunological mediators. Each method has its negative and positive sides. The Authros should underline in this interesting review: -All reported methods present the limitation to be qualitative and not quantitative assessments -Today we are able only to give a phenotypic definition of the immunological response, based on number and tupe of cells which infiltrate the cancer. But what s their role and efficacyy -Major development in evaluating the efficacy of the immunological system will come from in vitro analysis of the behaviour of those infiltrating cells: which factors do they produce? which antibodies do they produce? the substances they produce are effective in neutralizing the growth and diffusion of the cancer cells of that specific patient? Every patients has his/her own genotype; instead to work hard to define phenotypes and genotypes, we could just look at the immediate effect of infiltrating cells , and eventually lumphocytes in the lymph nodes, on cancer cells behaviour. In other words this is a very interesting review that show the cuurrent methods to analyze the immunological response to colorectakl cancer. The conclusion is that we are llost in thye definition of mechanisms without looking at practical effects, and probably this is a major problem in basic research in all medical field. All this assumptions of mine should be somehow introduced in the coonclusions. Finally, the paper will be more readable if picture related to the different techniiques will added to the paper.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[] The same title



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

☐ Duplicate publication

☐ Plagiarism

☐ Y No

BPG Search:

☐ The same title

☐ Duplicate publication

☐ Plagiarism

☐ Y No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39107

Title: Multiparametric Analysis of Colorectal Cancer Immune Responses

Reviewer's code: 03321614

Reviewer's country: France

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-04-13

Date reviewed: 2018-05-05

Review time: 22 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Interesting review, well written, I have a few comments: -Title should be adapted because this review is focused on T subsets rather than all immune cells (e.g. myeloid regulatory cells, stromal cells). This is a lack of the manuscript. -Immune cell plasticity section: should also be expanded, few data on TAMs for instance -page 7: the section



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

starting with "The role of Tregs in CRC..." should not be in the section related to the multidimensional analysis -page 7: please cite the "exhaustion" markers -page 8 and 10: 100 markers simultaneously analyzed by mass cytometry and IMC is very optimistic. For now 40-45 is more realistic.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No