

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39136

Title: Immune therapies in PDAC : where are we now?

Reviewer's code: 04008867

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-04-04

Date reviewed: 2018-04-10

Review time: 5 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Please see my detailed edits/comments in the attachment. Most are just style or grammar. Overall, it's a good review. I think the table is the most valuable part of your work. The figures are not very helpful or original. I think they need significantly more detailed captions in order to be helpful.



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39136

Title: Immune therapies in PDAC : where are we now?

Reviewer's code: 00646291

Reviewer's country: United Kingdom

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-04-04

Date reviewed: 2018-04-11

Review time: 7 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review is informative listing an extensive list of recent sources in the field and the illustrations facilitate understanding of complicated concept for the reader who is a non-expert. Some minor suggestions for authors' consideration are listed below: The quality of the review could benefit from restructuring the different sections indicating



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

the introduction as number 1 and then the “Results of immune therapies in PDAC” was included in the section entitled “Methods” and the outcomes of the clinical trials were described in a separate section entitled “Results”. The subsections “Reasons why checkpoint inhibitor (CPI) monotherapies failed to show any activity in PDAC” and “Research Challenges” could be combined in one section entitled “Discussion” and the “Rethink clinical trials” and “Conclusions” in a section entitled “Conclusions and future directions”. Minor comments Page 3, Abstract ...allow the identification Page 8: “major histocompatibility complex” instead of “major human compatibility” Page 9: “...has long been thought to physically “impede” T cell infiltration” Page 9: “...which are “pejorative” prognostic factor” Page 13: “...due to cytokinic axes...” Page 16: “unelucidated”

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39136

Title: Immune therapies in PDAC : where are we now?

Reviewer's code: 00742268

Reviewer's country: Saudi Arabia

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-04-10

Date reviewed: 2018-04-20

Review time: 10 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The researchers performed a focused review on immunotherapy modalities in PDAC. They provide an overview of molecular mechanism of the limited effectiveness of CPI and other immunotherapies in PDAC, and report on new combination therapies aiming to tackle the immunosuppressive characteristics of the majority of PDAC.



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

Comments The review is well structured and fulfills its main purpose. Either quote or mention all MMR key genes: MMR machinery is encoded by four key genes (MLH1, MSH1, MSH6, PMS2),... Context not very clear: Indeed, recruitment of unspecific lymphocytes may be driven by CXCL9 and CXCL10 secretion. Table 1: where applicable, the arms of the trials should be stated. It should be stated how in practice `not good candidate patients` are handled in regard to include or exclude them from trials: Moreover, patients with heavily pre-treated, progressive, advanced PDAC are not good candidates for immune therapy... Should be rephrased: Firstly, tumor immunogenicity is mandatory an efficient immune response. Typo, idenfication: identification It should be checked if in certain cases the official journal title abbreviations were used.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No