

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39147

Title: Gastric cancer in Alaska Native people: A cancer health disparity

Reviewer's code: 00068723

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2018-04-02

Date reviewed: 2018-04-02

Review time: 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors performed clinico-pathological investigation of gastric cancer in Alaska Native people and non-Hispanic White. They found that younger age at diagnosis, non-cardiac location, signet ring cell, and poor survival in AN as compared with NHW. This study is important for AN patients with gastric cancer to improve survival Signet

ring cell and poor survival may be attributable to that AN people may visit hospital at later stage of gastric cancer. But younger age and different location was not explained by this hypothesis. Was there any speculation to these results-younger age and location? Were there any differences between Alaska and the other states in the US in terms of medical systems? Number of hospitals per people, medical insurance company, average distance of patients and hospitals. As stated in Discussion, number of study subjects were different. NHW=40717, AN=132. What specific affect to results did the authors have in mind regarding this point? Patient survival was longer in those with chronic gastritis. Was there any speculation to this result? It is expected that early diagnosis would improve patient survival. Was there any screening system of gastric cancer in Alaska or the other states of the US? For example, upper gastrointestinal series.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39147

Title: Gastric cancer in Alaska Native people: A cancer health disparity

Reviewer's code: 00477066

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2018-04-02

Date reviewed: 2018-04-03

Review time: 1 Day

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting manuscript aiming to evaluate gastric cancer among Alaska native patients. However it is very difficult to analyze the features of a cancer on a specific population evaluating only the clinical characteristics of 132 patients. Further more representative well-designed studies are needed to give some conclusion.



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39147

Title: Gastric cancer in Alaska Native people: A cancer health disparity

Reviewer's code: 00505467

Reviewer's country: Greece

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2018-04-02

Date reviewed: 2018-04-09

Review time: 7 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

There is definitely an issue with this retrospective, surveillance study especially in the year 2018 with an original title: "Gastric cancer in Alaska Native people: A cancer health disparity" considering the title referred and approved in the Institutional Review Board Approval Form : "Molecular Characterization of Gastric cancer in Alaska Native people"

which sounds considerably prospective and a promising one, but certainly indicates a totally different kind of study. Moreover, this observational report presents several intriguing results regarding the classic clinicopathologic features of gastric cancer in Alaska Native (AN) patients, like higher incidence rate, poorer overall survival, younger age and more advanced disease, different type and location of the disease in contrast to US non-Hispanic White (NHW), which definitely deserve further, and in depth study. On the other hand, this manuscript has severe limitations, considering the small number of AN patients and the slow aggregation rate do NOT provide adequate sample in order to conduct safe investigation of all the confounders. Additionally, there is a loss of data from history due to retrospective nature of this report, and data missing for about 20% of all AN gastric cancer patients, which introduces a serious element of selection bias.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39147

Title: Gastric cancer in Alaska Native people: A cancer health disparity

Reviewer's code: 00052339

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2018-04-02

Date reviewed: 2018-04-10

Review time: 8 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Gastric cancer in Alaska Native people: A cancer health disparity Martinson HA et al.
This manuscript described the characteristic of gastric cancer in Alaskan Native people. The features of gastric cancer were very similar to those reported in East Asian. In this point, there were no novel findings to identify the specificity of gastric cancer in Alaskan



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

Native people. The only difference of gastric cancer between the East Asian and Alaskan Native people was age distribution. The prevalence rate of gastric cancer is higher in the elder people, however, this manuscript pointed out the high prevalence in the under 54 years in Alaskan Native people. The author can explain the mechanisms for this phenomenon.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No