

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 39238

Title: Proton beam therapy in apneic oxygenation treatment of an unresectable hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 00503849

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2018-04-08

Date reviewed: 2018-04-09

Review time: 1 Day

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting manuscript which may provide useful clinical information to the readers. It may be considered to be published after the authors revise the manuscript based on the comments Introduction Page 5: Although surgical resection and liver

transplantation are the first-line curative treatments for HCC, local ablative techniques are also curative treatments in small HCC. Therefore, the sentence “For patients with unresectable tumors.....other locoregional treatment modalities are usually considered as palliative options; these include arterial catheter-based treatments, ablative techniques and radiation therapy.” needs to be revised. Case report Page 6: Sorafenib is not one kind of immunotherapy in HCC. Discussion Page 8: The authors described “Choi et al [12] reviewed the different techniques and summarized the results of radiotherapy, partially combined with liver transplantation, TACE and concomitant chemotherapy, for HCC in each tumor stage.”. However, the final conclusions from Choi et al were not clearly mentioned to support the following sentence” With respect to this large variety of data in the literature...”. Page 9: Spelling error for “Although the patient presented in our case report had several adverse prognostic factors, his case demonstrates...”. Figure Figure 1 The authors stated that “The tumor involved all three hepatic veins and the portal vein, compressing the inferior vena cava (Figure 1A-C).” in section of case report page 5. The authors should provide additional MRI pictures to clearly show tumor thrombi in what branch or branches of portal vein. Moreover, the authors also need to provide clear pictures of tumor thrombi in 3 major hepatic veins. If there was no definite evidence to support HCC invasion into these vessels, the manuscript should be revised based on definite evidence.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- [] The same title
- [] Duplicate publication
- [] Plagiarism
- [Y] No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<https://www.wjgnet.com>

BPG Search:

[] The same title

[] Duplicate publication

[] Plagiarism

[Y] No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 39238

Title: Proton beam therapy in apneic oxygenation treatment of an unresectable hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 03261379

Reviewer's country: Romania

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2018-05-18

Date reviewed: 2018-05-28

Review time: 10 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Congratulations on a well documented article and on your success with the patient. I think external beam radiation for liver cancer is an underestimated option and has a great value, as more and more cases of unresectable HCC appear. My suggestion would be to



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

insert a statement regarding the full oncologic evaluation of the patients- upper and lower GI endoscopy, thoracic CT scan, to prove there were no other concomitant tumors. Also, please explain if special tests were used to determine whether the patient would withstand apneic oxygenation. While this method cannot be generalized without further clinical trials comparing radiation therapy with the other options available for HCC, especially sorafenib (as they both address the same tumor extension- unresectable/ invasive), it clearly opens new possibilities for patients with HCC.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No