



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39327

Title: Expansion of the Hepatocellular Carcinoma Milan criteria in Liver Transplantation
- where are we heading?

Reviewer's code: 00058381

Reviewer's country: Austria

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2018-04-21

Date reviewed: 2018-04-28

Review time: 7 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Major Comments: This manuscript provides an overview on experiences with the expansion of the Milan criteria in liver transplantation for hepatocellular carcinoma. Some items remain vague and further studies are needed, but this is, of course, not the



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

fault of the authors. The contributions of each of the authors should be specified. Minor Comments: Language polishing is required; e.g. "Two conclusion can be drawn from this study", "In the last reports of the US transplant registry, the HCV is no longer the principal indication for liver transplantation, being overcome by the HCC and the alcohol", etc. Some sentences are incomplete ("The main advantage of the Metroticket is that, by offering individualized survival predictions, could play a role in the regional organ allocation process") or contain too many words ("By diminishing the HCV indication for LT, the liver grafts that that no longer would be necessary for these patients could be used to explore the expansion beyond MC"). Please correct the typing errors (e.g., "cavaveric", "togheter", "OS - overall surviva") as well.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39327

Title: Expansion of the Hepatocellular Carcinoma Milan criteria in Liver Transplantation
- where are we heading?

Reviewer's code: 00005855

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2018-04-21

Date reviewed: 2018-04-29

Review time: 7 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors review the current status of LT beyond Milan criteria in three different scenarios that are all important in clinical practice. They comprehensively referred appropriate publications most of that are milestones in the topics. Therefore, this review



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

will be beneficial for the WJG readers. There are a few questions and issues to be addressed. 1. In "The effect of expanding beyond Milan criteria on the liver transplantation waiting list" section, the authors discussed over the effect of expanding beyond Milan on the effect on the post-transplant survival of all the patients in the waiting list. How about the overall survival of all the patients in the waiting list including those who had been lost without LT, since as the authors pointed out, those increasing number of patients will be lost before LT because of the increased number of candidates in the waiting list. 2. Even if the expanding beyond Milan increased the candidate in the waiting list, the reviewer believe it may not be harmful, if an appropriate criteria for the order of waiting list have been applied. 3. In the "Future directions", Line 4. There is a redundant "that".

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39327

Title: Expansion of the Hepatocellular Carcinoma Milan criteria in Liver Transplantation
- where are we heading?

Reviewer's code: 02527644

Reviewer's country: Germany

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2018-04-21

Date reviewed: 2018-05-03

Review time: 11 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a fine review on some specific and important topics in the context of liver transplantation in Milan Out HCC patients. The topic is of current importance, the manuscript is well written and easy to follow. Apart from that, to my opinion, the



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

authors have drawn the right conclusions from the stated literature. What makes this review different from other Reviews in this field is the concentration on three major issues that we are currently dealing with.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39327

Title: Expansion of the Hepatocellular Carcinoma Milan criteria in Liver Transplantation
- where are we heading?

Reviewer’s code: 02861333

Reviewer’s country: China

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2018-04-21

Date reviewed: 2018-05-05

Review time: 13 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> General
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review deeply analyzed the Expansion of the Milan criteria of Hepatocellular Carcinoma for Liver Transplantation. A good review for the topic.



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No