

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 39332

**Title:** Primary sclerosing cholangitis associated colitis: Characterization of clinical, histologic features, and their associations with liver transplantation

**Reviewer's code:** 02462207

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Associate Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** South Korea

**Author's Country/Territory:** United States

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-03-30

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jie Wang (Quit in 2020)

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-04-07 12:08

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-04-13 04:26

**Review time:** 5 Days and 16 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Authors comprehensively described PSC-UC and PSC-CD cases in comparison with IBD without PSC cases in terms of disease extent, inflammatory activity, prevalence of dysplasia, and requirements for liver transplantation. Authors carefully chose cases and matched controls and described clinicopathologic features well. Most of the contents look original and acceptable for publication. Several minor points are to be addressed. 1. Table 4 is somewhat confusing because only p values are shown. Obviously authors compared cases with liver transplantation vs. those without liver transplantation in PSC-UC and in PSC-IBD patients respectively. Thus, it would be much better to show include all data in the Table 4 (number of patients, percentage, and p-value for each variable). In addition, some of the data do not match the main text: activity scores in the left colon of PSC-UC patients with OLT vs. those without OLT,  $p=0.0568$  in the main text but 0.0599 in the Table 4. Please inspect the data carefully and fix them. 2. How did authors define PSC-CD? Although authors followed “established guidelines”, many of the PSC-CD cases apparently had overlapping features with UC. As authors discussed in the “Discussion” section, it would have been difficult to diagnose PSC-CD unless there was no ileal stricture or granuloma. Please provide more detailed clinicopathologic features that led to the diagnosis of PSC-CD: characteristic colonoscopic, radiologic, or histologic appearances. Some supplementary figures of those characteristic features might be helpful for readers.