

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**Manuscript NO:** 39635

**Title:** Liver transplantation and atrial fibrillation: A meta-analysis

**Reviewer's code:** 03538158

**Reviewer's country:** Japan

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2018-05-03

**Date reviewed:** 2018-05-03

**Review time:** 2 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Chokesuwattanaskul et al. performed the meta-analysis about atrial fibrillation in liver transplantation. Authors should discuss the cause of AF in liver transplantation more.

### INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

*Google Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

*BPG Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**Manuscript NO:** 39635

**Title:** Liver transplantation and atrial fibrillation: A meta-analysis

**Reviewer's code:** 00051373

**Reviewer's country:** Taiwan

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2018-05-03

**Date reviewed:** 2018-05-03

**Review time:** 12 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

A meta-analysis to investigate the relationship between AF and liver transplant patients. An interesting topic and an extensive review. It should be benefit to the most of the readers in the liver transplantation setting. Well manuscript written and organized regarding to easily understanding.

## INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

### *Google Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

### *BPG Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**Manuscript NO:** 39635

**Title:** Liver transplantation and atrial fibrillation: A meta-analysis

**Reviewer's code:** 00058381

**Reviewer's country:** Austria

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2018-05-03

**Date reviewed:** 2018-05-05

**Review time:** 2 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

**Major Comments:** This manuscript provides a review and a meta-analysis on atrial fibrillation before and after liver transplantation. Limitations are mentioned by the authors at the end of the discussion. **Minor Comments:** First Page, "Authors' Contributions": The contribution of each of the authors should be specified in more

detail. Introduction, first sentence: “peoples” -> people. Results, first paragraph: “After the exclusion of 83 articles based on title and abstract for clearly not fulfilling inclusion criteria on the basis of type of article, study design, population or outcome of interest, leaving 38 articles for full-length review.” - Please complete this sentence. Discussion, first paragraph: “to those patients who underwent heart transplantation (incidence of AF up to 40%) (39-44) other open-heart surgeries (incidence of AF up to 50%) (5, 45, 46).” -> to those patients who underwent heart transplantation (incidence of AF up to 40%) (39-44) or other open-heart surgeries (incidence of AF up to 50%) (5, 45, 46). Discussion, penultimate paragraph: “Our study has a several noteworthy limitations. Firstly, heterogeneities in definition, for an example how to define AF, early and late development of AF, among the different studies precludes to draw the definite causality, in addition to association. Secondly, duration of follow up over the postoperative period, by some study trace forward for just 30 days post-transplantation, does not long enough to reveal the long-term morbidity and mortality outcome.” - Please correct/improve these three sentences. Discussion, last paragraph: “In conclusion, our study demonstrated the prevalence of preexisting AF in patient underwent liver transplantation, incidence of AF post-liver transplantation and association of AF with higher morbidity and mortality among liver transplant recipients. Further studies are needed to explore in detail of AF in these patients, which we strongly believe that AF management would be an important part in the care of liver transplant.” - Please correct/improve this paragraph as well. Table 1: All the abbreviations should be explained (AKI, ATTRm). Table 1 (20-23), “Outcomes”, rightmost column: “Study aim to compare outcome as CV event after liver transplant between patient with NASH and those with alcoholic cirrhosis who receive liver transplant” -> ...patients... Table 1 (20-23) and (28-31), second column, Newcastle-Ottawa scale: “E3”? Figure 3: “Nicolau-raducu” -> Nicolau-Raducu.

## INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

### *Google Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

### *BPG Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**Manuscript NO:** 39635

**Title:** Liver transplantation and atrial fibrillation: A meta-analysis

**Reviewer's code:** 03253490

**Reviewer's country:** Turkey

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2018-05-03

**Date reviewed:** 2018-05-14

**Review time:** 11 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Chokesuwattanaskul et al. investigated 'Liver Transplantation and Atrial Fibrillation'. The topic is interesting. The author should discuss the mechanisms and types of cardiovascular complications and AF in advanced liver diseases more.





**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

## INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

### *Google Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

### *BPG Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No