



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39862

Title: Role of colectomy in preventing recurrent primary sclerosing cholangitis in liver transplant recipients

Reviewer's code: 02530754

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2018-05-16

Date reviewed: 2018-05-18

Review time: 1 Day

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The present manuscript by Buchholz BM et al. is a nice systematic review which aimed to evaluate the role of profilactic colectomy in liver transplant patients with PSC in order to prevent post-LT disease recurrence. The authors concluded that pre/peri transplant



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

colectomy may have a protective role in this scenario but no randomized trials are available and therefore no strong recommendation can be made. The manuscript is informative and reads well. The literature search strategy is updated. The topic is attractive and timely. The authors are kindly invited to consider the following minor comments: - The authors said that “literature search was independently conducted by 2 authors (B.M.B, P.M.L.)”. If any disagreement was found, I presume that a third author resolved it. If it is so, please add a statement in methods. - The literature search strategy is not sufficiently clear and 180 initial records seemed to me too few. I would recommend to include a supplementary table including the combinations of MESH terms used. - Although the quality of the studies included according to the MINORS criteria was overall reported as high, the authors admitted that all of them were observational, retrospective and some of them insufficiently powered. There is an inherent increased risk of bias given that patients undergoing colectomy are clinically selected, and probably had a more severe IBD. Therefore it is highly probable that the protective role of colectomy may have been underestimated in the available studies. In my opinion, this aspect should be further discussed. Conclusions may be also softened while emphasizing the need of prospective studies and randomized trials. - I agree with the authors that a universal colectomy in PSC transplant candidates may not be currently justified in light of the available evidence. However, there are subgroups of patients with high risk of an aggressive recurrence such as young patients with early graft loss (<5 years) because of recurrent PSC in whom a retransplantation is being considered. In opinion of the authors, is profilactic colectomy advisable in this clinical context? I know there is little supporting evidence but some speculation here would be welcomed.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 39862

Title: Role of colectomy in preventing recurrent primary sclerosing cholangitis in liver transplant recipients

Reviewer's code: 03253490

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2018-05-16

Date reviewed: 2018-05-30

Review time: 14 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Buchholz et al. reviewed 'The published evidence on the role of colectomy in preventing rPSC in LT recipients.'The focus of the review is very interesting. The review is well written and has enough priority for publication.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No