

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 40722

Title: Photodynamic therapy for middle-advanced stage upper gastrointestinal carcinomas: A systematic review and meta-analysis

Reviewer's code: 02440467

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ruo-Yu Ma

Date sent for review: 2018-07-20

Date reviewed: 2018-07-21

Review time: 1 Day

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Editor thank you for inviting me to review this article entitled: Photodynamic therapy for middle-advanced stage upper gastrointestinal carcinomas: A systematic review and meta-analysis. The article is a correct mata-analysis with the methodology



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

strictly adherent to PRISMA guidelines of ten random controlled clinical trials which included 953 patients affected by upper gastrointestinal cancers at middle-advanced stage of disease and submitted to Photodynamic therapy (PDT) alone or in combination to other non-surgical treatment such as chemotherapy, radiotherapy. The risks of multiple biases bias and the quality of the individual studies were assessed using funnel plots and the Cochrane System Evaluation Manual Intervention. The results showed that the effective rate of PDT was better than that of radiotherapy or Nd:YAG laser for the treatment of middle-advanced stage upper gastrointestinal cancers. Furthermore, PDT combined with chemotherapy gave significantly better efficacy and higher one-year survival rates than did PDT or chemotherapy alone. The quality of the studies available for meta-analysis could not include multicenter, double-blind, randomized controlled trials which could provide stronger support to conclusions. In my opinion, the meta-analysis is well conducted and offer a new perspective on PDT which can be considered suitable for single or combined treatment of middle-advanced stage upper gastrointestinal cancers, especially for patients who are unfit for surgery. The study with the meta-analysis is very well organized and the manuscript is very well written; only one typo in line 359 "the number of studies included in this analysis were (was) relatively small".

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<https://www.wjgnet.com>

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 40722

Title: Photodynamic therapy for middle-advanced stage upper gastrointestinal carcinomas: A systematic review and meta-analysis

Reviewer's code: 03257741

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ruo-Yu Ma

Date sent for review: 2018-07-20

Date reviewed: 2018-08-12

Review time: 23 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

First, the author tried to determine the effect of photodynamic therapy (PDT) for middle-advanced stage upper gastrointestinal carcinomas. Through this manuscript, the author showed that PDT is a useful method for the treatment of middle-advanced



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

stage upper gastrointestinal cancers. PDT combined with chemotherapy or radiotherapy can enhance its efficacy and prolong survival time. It is very interesting. Second, this is meta-analysis, the methods for the selection materials is very reasonable. Third, I would like to know the more detail about intervention protocols and chemotherapy protocol and population for each articles in Table 1

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No