



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Cardiology

**Manuscript NO:** 41418

**Title:** Surgical Left Atrial Appendage Occlusion During Cardiac Surgery: A Systematic Review and Meta-analysis.

**Reviewer’s code:** 02446706

**Reviewer’s country:** Netherlands

**Science editor:** Ying Dou

**Date sent for review:** 2018-08-09

**Date reviewed:** 2018-08-10

**Review time:** 1 Day

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY                                     | LANGUAGE QUALITY  | CONCLUSION   | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS                      |
|--|---|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing       | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                    | Peer-Review:                                  |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language | (High priority)                                    | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good                 | polishing   | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                    | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous              |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of           | (General priority)                                 | Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the              |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not               | language polishing  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript:                      |
| publish  | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision            | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced             |
|  |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                 | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General   |
|  |   |  | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise         |
|  |   |  | Conflicts-of-Interest:                        |
|  |   |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes                  |
|  |   |  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No        |

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The authors, Atti and colleagues describe in A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis the place of routine surgical left atrial appendage occlusion during concomitant cardiac surgery. However, there are some issues which should be dealt with to increase the



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

readability and structure of the manuscript. There are some minor errors: - Throughout the manuscript, references in text should be in square brackets and superscript at the end of the sentence [0]. - Period and comma are missing after et al., throughout the manuscript. - References should be arranged according to the requirements of the Journal. - On page 7: Valve surgery: Garcia-Fernandez [3], Nagpal [8], Lee [5] and Elbadawi [12] are cited without mentioning the reference. - CABG: Healey [7], and Elbadawi [11]. - Table 1: In the first column to the left: By adding the reference to the study mentioned will increase clarity. - Table 2: In the first column to the left: The year and references are missing. - Table 3: In the first column to the left: References are missing. - Page 17: Separate Table legends are not necessary.

## INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

### *Google Search:*

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

### *BPG Search:*

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Cardiology

**Manuscript NO:** 41418

**Title:** Surgical Left Atrial Appendage Occlusion During Cardiac Surgery: A Systematic Review and Meta-analysis.

**Reviewer's code:** 00214240

**Reviewer's country:** Belgium

**Science editor:** Ying Dou

**Date sent for review:** 2018-08-09

**Date reviewed:** 2018-08-15

**Review time:** 5 Days

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY                                     | LANGUAGE QUALITY   | CONCLUSION                                 | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS                                  |
|--|--|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing     | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept            | Peer-Review:  |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing           | (High priority)                            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous             |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good                 |  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous                          |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | (General priority)                         | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript: |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish       | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection                          | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision    | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced              |
|  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision    | <input type="checkbox"/> General                          |
|  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection         | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise                     |
|  |  |  | Conflicts-of-Interest:                                    |
|  |  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes                              |
|  |  |  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No                    |

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

this is well written , well done systematic review and meta analysis of an important topic the question what to do with the LAA is pending already for years the limitations are well documented, mainly the absence of long term follow-up although surgical closure



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

rates are not discusses , different surgical techniques could give different complete closure of LAA, results are there message is important

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No