

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Clinical Cases

**Manuscript NO:** 42129

**Title:** Defecation difficulties caused by Chilaiditi syndrome: A case report

**Reviewer's code:** 02989927

**Reviewer's country:** Brazil

**Science editor:** Ying Dou

**Date sent for review:** 2018-09-26

**Date reviewed:** 2018-09-26

**Review time:** 10 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a case report of a rare case of Chilaiditi syndrome. This was clearly described by the authors throughout the manuscript. Diagnostic images were supplied. Recommendations to improve the manuscript: (a) do replace the expression "defecation difficulties" by something more technical or descriptive (in Title and

throughout the text body). This is too vague. (b) do describe clearly what is a Chilaiditi sign and the full syndrome in Introduction; (c) do expand the literature review (find my suggestions below); (d) instead of reiterating the findings, put this case in clinical perspective as conclusion. Do surgeons and medical students need suspect routinely this syndrome? What are the best treatment evidence to this syndrome? What has to be done in future studies for clarifying its etiology? and (e) minor review of English language (e.g., place a comma before the word "which"). Suggested references: 1. Barroso Jorner JM, Balaguer A, Escibano J, et al. Chilaiditi's syndrome associated with transverse colon volvulus: first report in a pediatric patient and review of the literature. *Eur J Pediatr Surg*. 2003;13:425-8. 2. Kamiyoshihara M, Ibe T, Takeyoshi I. Chilaiditi's sign mimicking a traumatic diaphragmatic hernia. *Ann Thorac Surg*. 2009;87:959-61. 3. Prieto-Díaz-Chávez E, Marentes EJJ, Medina CJL, et al. Síndrome de Chilaiditi como un problema de decisión quirúrgica: reporte de un caso y revisión de la literatura. *Cir Gen*. 2007;29:294-6. 4. Chilaiditi D. Zur Frage der Hepatoptose und Ptose im allgemeinen im Anschluss an drei fälle von temporarae, partiellae Leberverlagerung. *Fortschr Geb Rontgenstr Nuklearmed*. 1910;16:173-208. 5. Prassopoulos PK, Raissaki MT, Gourtsoyiannis NC. Hepatodiaphragmatic interposition of the colon in the upright and supine position. *J Comput Assist Tomogr*. 1996;20:151-3. 6. Jackson ADM, Hodson CJ. Interposition of the colon between liver and diaphragm (Chilaiditi's syndrome) in children. *Arch Dis Child*. 1957;32: 151-8. [ Links ] 7. Duarte MA, Carvalho AST, Penna FJ, et al. Síndrome de Chilaidite na infância (interposição hepato-diafragmática do colo) - relato de cinco casos. *Pediatr (S. Paulo)*. 1983;5:379-82. 8. Farkas R, Moalem J, Hammond J. Chilaiditi's sign in a blunt trauma patient: a case report and review of the literature. *J Trauma*. 2008;65:1540-2. 9. Sorrentino D, Bazzocchi M, Badano L, et al. Heart-touching Chilaiditi's syndrome. *World J Gastroenterol*. 2005;11:4607-9. 10. Nurdjanah S, Bayupurnama P, Maduseno S, et al. Abdominal malignant fibrous



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

histiocytoma infiltrating stomach with Chilaiditi's sign manifestation (a rare case report).  
Kobe J Med Sci. 2007; 53:119-24. 11. Nagem, RG, Freitas, HL. Síndrome de Chilaiditi:  
relato de caso. Radiologia Brasileira, 2011; 44(5), 333-335.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Clinical Cases

**Manuscript NO:** 42129

**Title:** Defecation difficulties caused by Chilaiditi syndrome: A case report

**Reviewer's code:** 00503536

**Reviewer's country:** Japan

**Science editor:** Ying Dou

**Date sent for review:** 2018-09-21

**Date reviewed:** 2018-09-30

**Review time:** 8 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript written by Luo et al. reports a case with Chilaiditi syndrome, who was treated by laparoscope-assisted right hemicolectomy. The case with Chilaiditi sign is not rare, and most of the patients with advanced liver cirrhosis show the sign due to the atrophy of right lobe of the liver. However, most of the patients with Chilaiditi sign do



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

not show any symptoms. The authors should discuss the factors that cause Chilaiditi syndrome from Chilaiditi sign. Furthermore, they should discuss more why operation was needed for this case, because most cases with Chilaiditi syndrome could be recovered by a conservative treatment.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Clinical Cases

**Manuscript NO:** 42129

**Title:** Defecation difficulties caused by Chilaiditi syndrome: A case report

**Reviewer's code:** 02445477

**Reviewer's country:** India

**Science editor:** Ying Dou

**Date sent for review:** 2018-10-04

**Date reviewed:** 2018-10-04

**Review time:** 0 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Rarity is no criteria There is Chiladiati syndrome but attributing it to colectomy, not plausible for defecation problem Not authentic case

### INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

*Google Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

*BPG Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Clinical Cases

**Manuscript NO:** 42129

**Title:** Defecation difficulties caused by Chilaiditi syndrome: A case report

**Reviewer's code:** 00504353

**Reviewer's country:** Japan

**Science editor:** Ying Dou

**Date sent for review:** 2018-10-04

**Date reviewed:** 2018-10-06

**Review time:** 2 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This report will be valuable for your readers to notice the rare disease. I have several minor comments. At second paragraph, which introduced Chilaiditi syndrome, citation looks missing. Please add article information. Figure 2 includes looks to include the patient information. It should be removed. Form of references looks not





**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

fixed. The article #6 started to describe authors' name with their first name, although others seemed to start with family name. Please fix them.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Clinical Cases

**Manuscript NO:** 42129

**Title:** Defecation difficulties caused by Chilaiditi syndrome: A case report

**Reviewer's code:** 03035498

**Reviewer's country:** Morocco

**Science editor:** Ying Dou

**Date sent for review:** 2018-10-04

**Date reviewed:** 2018-10-06

**Review time:** 2 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This a nicely written article. The clinical case is well presented and overall, respects the general guidelines for clinical cases. I have somme comments for the authors: - Introduction section: the specific message of the article is not highlighted. Authors should specify what is interesting about their case. - Clinical case: - the images



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

are too small to be viewed comfortably. - could the authors describe exactly  
what was the defecation problem for the patient - Discussion: - all the  
discussion section is a mini-review of the literature not with no link with the clinical case.  
- Surgery is not the first line treatment for this disease. Especially, the use of laparoscopic  
surgery. How often surgery is used and what are the results in the literature?

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Clinical Cases

**Manuscript NO:** 42129

**Title:** Defecation difficulties caused by Chilaiditi syndrome: A case report

**Reviewer's code:** 00039422

**Reviewer's country:** Italy

**Science editor:** Ying Dou

**Date sent for review:** 2018-10-04

**Date reviewed:** 2018-10-07

**Review time:** 3 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is an interesting report about a rare syndrome. English language and style should be improved. The syndrome could be considered often like a volvulus of the R colon. The authors repeat several times that that condition is easily misdiagnosed. I would be more careful, considering that, as the authors stated, a chest x-ray, a plan abdominal x-ray and

abdominal US could rise the suspect of this diagnosis. All of these are simple diagnostic tools. A colonoscopy might not be helpful, as it was indeed in this patient, and this should be outlined. Colonoscopy described “cicatricial changes of the mucous membrane”. Could the authors better explain this finding? Is mucous membrane the colonic mucosa? Which are exactly the features of cicatricial changes? The similarity to volvulus, either for symptoms (worsening constipation) or for the surgical management, in my opinion should be emphasized. Figures are well representative, and References are updated.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Clinical Cases

**Manuscript NO:** 42129

**Title:** Defecation difficulties caused by Chilaiditi syndrome: A case report

**Reviewer's code:** 01557050

**Reviewer's country:** Japan

**Science editor:** Ying Dou

**Date sent for review:** 2018-09-21

**Date reviewed:** 2018-10-09

**Review time:** 18 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dr. Luo and Dr. Yu reported 'Defecation difficulties caused by Chilaiditi syndrome: A case report'. The manuscript is informative and well-presented. Comments The reviewer has no comments.

## INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

### *Google Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

### *BPG Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No