Baishideng Publishing Group

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 43097

Title: Serum hepatitis B virus RNA is a predictor of HBeAg seroconversion and virological response with entecavir treatment in chronic hepatitis B patients

Reviewer's code: 00071703

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Ruo-Yu Ma

Date sent for review: 2018-12-03

Date reviewed: 2018-12-07

Review time: 14 Hours, 4 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	[ ] Accept (High priority)	Peer-Review:
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[Y] Accept (General priority)	[Y] Anonymous
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Minor revision	[ ] Onymous
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Major revision	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
[ ] Grade E: Do not publish		[ ] Rejection	[Y] Advanced
			[ ] General
			[ ] No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			[ ] Yes
			[Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Serum HBV RNA is a predictor of HBeAg seroconversion and virological response with entecavir treatment in CHB patients   In this study, the authors aimed to investigate whether HBV RNA can predict virological response or HBeAg seroconversion during

ETV treatment when HBV DNA is undetectable. Thirty treatment-naive individuals were included in the study. They found that HBeAg seroconversion was more likely in CHB patients with HBV RNA levels below 4.12 log10 copies/ml before treatment. They have concluded that Serum HBV RNA can predict HBeAg seroconversion and partial virological response during treatment. In the partial virological response group, serum HBV RNA showed an increasing trend. I think this is a good study, and the manuscript is well written; also the tables are all appropriate.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[   ] The same title

[   ] Duplicate publication

[   ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[   ] The same title

[   ] Duplicate publication

[   ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 43097

Title: Serum hepatitis B virus RNA is a predictor of HBeAg seroconversion and virological response with entecavir treatment in chronic hepatitis B patients

Reviewer's code: 02445074

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Ruo-Yu Ma

Date sent for review: 2018-12-18

Date reviewed: 2018-12-19

Review time: 20 Hours, 1 Day

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	[ ] Accept (High priority)	Peer-Review:
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Accept (General priority)	[Y] Anonymous
[ ] Grade C: Good			[ ] Onymous
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[Y] Minor revision	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
[ ] Grade E: Do not publish	[ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Major revision	[Y] Advanced
		[ ] Rejection	[ ] General
			[ ] No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			[ ] Yes
			[Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

GENERAL COMMENTS: Other studies have shown that in HBV patients while HBV DNA is found in serum, there is at levels at least 1,000-fold lower, HBV RNA. And, yet other studies have shown that if HBV DNA levels are lower, then antiviral treatments

are more likely to succeed. The present studies would like to test/assert that serum HBV RNA, although more difficult to detect, might be a better way to predict/confirm success in antiviral therapies. A major problem of the present study is the limited number of patients with which to test the hypothesis. The accepted patient groups contain only 10 and 15 individuals, with 5 uninfected controls. This major problem remains unsolved even though the authors have provided an heroic attempt at evaluating data for statistical significance. What might be a second problem is the specificity of the RNA assays. The assays might yet be detecting residual HBV DNA. That is, since the HBV DNA is initially in an excess of at least 1,000 fold, the RNA isolation/assay must be much greater than 99.9% greater in removing/detecting DNA. This reviewer did not see control data, obtained in the absence of the reverse transcription step. SPECIFIC COMMENTS: Abstract Remove use of first person. Introduction In 1996 Kock first demonstrated that … HBV RNA levels in serum were … characteristics of alterations of serum HBV RNA were … Patients The criteria for inclusion were: (a) patients … The criteria for exclusion were: … Informed consent was obtained for all enrolled patients and the study protocol … by the Ethics Committee … Results (83%) (37 +/- 6 vs. 33 +/- 12) (3.1 +/- 1.4 vs. 5.5 +/- 1.5) Not convincing that this is a statistically significant difference!! various personal background!! Define flRNA and trRNA Table 3 HBeAg positive

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[   ] The same title

[   ] Duplicate publication

[   ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[   ] The same title

[   ] Duplicate publication

[   ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

Baishideng Publishing Group

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 43097

Title: Serum hepatitis B virus RNA is a predictor of HBeAg seroconversion and virological response with entecavir treatment in chronic hepatitis B patients

Reviewer's code: 02994003

Reviewer's country: Egypt

Science editor: Ruo-Yu Ma

Date sent for review: 2018-12-18

Date reviewed: 2018-12-21

Review time: 13 Hours, 3 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	[ ] Accept (High priority)	Peer-Review:
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Accept (General priority)	[Y] Anonymous
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[Y] Minor revision	[ ] Onymous
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Major revision	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
[ ] Grade E: Do not publish		[ ] Rejection	[ ] Advanced
			[Y] General
			[ ] No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			[ ] Yes
			[Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology Manuscript Type: OBSERVATIONAL STUDY   Serum HBV RNA is a predictor of HBeAg seroconversion and virological response with entecavir treatment in CHB patients   Generally, the idea

of this study is good and the manuscript is well written although it needs minor error editing   Title is ok Abstract is simple and please change word discussion to conclusion Key words are enough   Introduction, materials and methods are clear.   Results contains enough tables and figures but there is several error editing   in tables- Please what about relation between HBV DNA and HBsAg   Discussion is ok although it is better if it is more longer with more references

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[   ] The same title

[   ] Duplicate publication

[   ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[   ] The same title

[   ] Duplicate publication

[   ] Plagiarism

[Y] No