



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 43200

Title: Comprehensive Lifestyle Intervention vs. Soy Protein-based Meal Regimen in Patients with Non-alcoholic Steatohepatitis

Reviewer's code: 03251829

Reviewer's country: Greece

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-11-01

Date reviewed: 2018-11-15

Review time: 14 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Non-alcoholic steatohepatitis (NASH) has nowadays become an epidemic. Apart from the presence of fat in the liver it is characterized by augmented intrahepatic inflammation and exacerbated hepatocellular injury. The presence of NASH in the liver



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

is associated with an increased possibility of development fibrosis, cirrhosis or even neoplasia. Taking that there is no clearly defined strategy among physicians for the prevention or treatment of NASH, studies focusing to this direction are of major importance. So far, physical activity or weight loss are recommended as potential interventions able to improve liver histology in NASH patients. In the present manuscript by Deibert et al, the authors have made an very good attempt to explore and compare the role of Lifestyle Intervention vs. Soy Protein-based Meal Regimen in the improvement of liver pathophysiology of Patients with Non-alcoholic Steatohepatitis. The paper is well written and thought out, clearly organized and structured, acknowledges appropriately other studies regarding the same subject and ends up in reasonable conclusions. In addition, the study is of high interest due to its direct clinical implications and the authors used correct methodology. Therefore my opinion and evaluation is positive. However, I still have some comments: -The caloric input of the participants, especially during the first 6 weeks of the interventions differed significantly between the 2 groups. How could the authors explain that the observed effect in liver pathophysiology and parameters was indeed related to meal replacement and not to the extensive caloric restriction that the patients underwent? -To the same direction, did the authors perform any kind of clinical, radiological or biochemical measurements in any intermediate timepoint within the 24 weeks (especially after the first 6 weeks that the interventions pertinent to calories differed significantly)? -How did the authors choose the type of exercise that was applied to the participants?

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[] The same title

[] Duplicate publication



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Plagiarism

No

BPG Search:

The same title

Duplicate publication

Plagiarism

No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 43200

Title: Comprehensive Lifestyle Intervention vs. Soy Protein-based Meal Regimen in Patients with Non-alcoholic Steatohepatitis

Reviewer's code: 00189256

Reviewer's country: Ukraine

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-11-10

Date reviewed: 2018-11-18

Review time: 8 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article analyzes the influence of the comprehensive lifestyle intervention vs. soy protein-based meal regimen in patients with non-alcoholic steatohepatitis. 36 patients with NASH participated in a randomized single-center study. They were randomly



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

assigned either to the meal replacement group with soy-yogurt-honey preparation or to the guided lifestyle change group with endurance activity and nutrition counselling. To solve this problem the authors have chosen an adequate research approach. The authors measured serum alanine transaminase (ALT), aspartate transaminase (AST), lipid parameters and adipokines; liver fat content and lipid composition by magnetic resonance imaging and magnetic resonance spectroscopy. Statistical analyses were conducted with SPSS software. Results were expressed as median interquartile range. The obtained results are discussed in-depth taking into account the latest data found in scientific publications on the investigated problem. The authors proved that comprehensive lifestyle intervention and meal replacement regimen have comparable effects on body and liver fat, as well as decrease in markers of hepatic inflammation among NASH patients. The more important results of investigation reflected that internal fat and hepatic lipid content were markedly reduced in both groups in comparable amount. There was a strong correlation between reduction in liver fat and decrease in ALT. Changes in adipokines, particularly in adiponectin and leptin were closely related to intrahepatic lipid changes. The authors devised the lifestyle program for patients of the change group. According to this program they attended 6 weekly teaching sessions about nutrition and physical exercise. The article is devoted to the subject of NASH prophylaxis, has practical significance and is illustrated with 4 figures and 2 charts. The material is presented logically and correctly. I recommend the article for publication.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[] The same title

[] Duplicate publication



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Plagiarism

No

BPG Search:

The same title

Duplicate publication

Plagiarism

No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 43200

Title: Comprehensive Lifestyle Intervention vs. Soy Protein-based Meal Regimen in Patients with Non-alcoholic Steatohepatitis

Reviewer's code: 01407353

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-11-10

Date reviewed: 2018-11-28

Review time: 18 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Here Deibert P. et al present a clinical study in which 22 patients with NAFLD are randomly assigned either to meal-replacement (MR) with a soy-yogurt-honey preparation or to guided lifestyle change with endurance activity and nutrition



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

counselling. Anthropometric and biochemical indices, as well as internal and liver fat content as determined by MR, are successfully affected by both therapeutic strategies although with some differences. I have the following points: 1) How was NASH diagnosed? On page 8, it is stated that "patients eligible for the study were obese adults with BMI between 30 and 40 and with sonographic findings of fatty liver as well as elevated liver enzymes". This is clearly not sufficient for a diagnosis of NASH. Conversely, on page 13, it is stated that patients were extracted among those already diagnosed as NASH, although it is not specified how the diagnosis of NASH has been done. This point should be clarified, and the discrepancy between the two statements should be solved 2) The specific composition of the soy-yogurt-honey preparation should be presented (grams of components, calories, etc...) 3) Results are redundantly presented in the text and in the tables. If numerical data are provided in the tables or figures, the text should be used only for the narrative presentations of results, referring to tables or Figure for numbers 4) All the sections of the text are excessively long and should be significantly shortened

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

[] Plagiarism

[Y] No