

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

Manuscript NO: 43304

Title: Return to sport after lower limb arthroplasty – why not for all?

Reviewer's code: 01209314

Reviewer's country: India

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2018-11-10

Date reviewed: 2018-11-11

Review time: 19 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Is it really advisable to go for athletic activity after TJR? If the patients in this series went for athletic activity, were they instructed to do so or the surgeons didn't impose any restrictions? What is the long-term outcome in such situations?....please include in discussion section Patients are often able to return to their chosen activity and perform



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

at a similar, if not better, ability in comparison to pre-operative levels. The above statement is not matching with the results of the study. The results show that patients are doing either better or much better after TJR. Patients are able to participate in athletic activity at least weekly, if not more frequently. This is also not matching with the results. The results show that the patients are going for athletic activity more frequently (>2-3 times/wk). A higher rate of return to athletic activity has been observed with later studies and may reflect a more relaxed attitude of surgeons to what their patients may be permitted to do after surgery based on a greater body of evidence. This explanation seems unjustified. It needs referencing. The present study shows that many patients are not returning back to sports just because they don't want to stress there joints /refusal by a doctor. What is the level of evidence to go for sports activity after TJR? Are there better evidences to support this statement? Does this statement indicate the attitude of the surgeon in the present series (because all patients went for athletic activity)? First of all, many explanations in the series are based on assumption, all these needs referencing. Secondly, this is a retrospective series and majority of the patients went for athletic activity; the reasons for such a huge return needs a proper explanation. Third, the title of the study should be " Attitude of patients towards athletic activity after TJR", because it is not certain whether the patients should go for athletic activity after TJR or not.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- [] The same title
- [] Duplicate publication
- [] Plagiarism
- [Y] No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<https://www.wjgnet.com>

BPG Search:

[] The same title

[] Duplicate publication

[] Plagiarism

[Y] No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

Manuscript NO: 43304

Title: Return to sport after lower limb arthroplasty – why not for all?

Reviewer's code: 03516969

Reviewer's country: New Zealand

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2018-11-19

Date reviewed: 2018-11-20

Review time: 6 Hours, 1 Day

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Title. The title reflects the methodology and results accurately 2 Abstract. Fine. 3 Key words. Fine 4 Background. Well written and concise. Clearly sets out the rationale for the study. 5 Methods. These are described well. STROBE guidelines mentioned. 6 Results. I felt that the results reflected the methodology set out. 7 Discussion. Well



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

written. 8 Illustrations and tables. Fine. Overall: Interesting, high quality article.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No