

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Clinical Cases

**Manuscript NO:** 43318

**Title:** Hand-assisted laparoscopic splenectomy is the ideal surgical treatment for patients with splenomegaly: a meta-analysis

**Reviewer's code:** 02845261

**Reviewer's country:** Greece

**Science editor:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Date sent for review:** 2018-11-08

**Date reviewed:** 2018-11-20

**Review time:** 12 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

**CRITIQUE** This manuscript is of significant scientific merit and should be published after a major revision has been made. It represents a meta-analysis of studies regarding the efficacy of HALS method for splenectomy. This topic has been a matter of study at



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

the decade of 2000, and it was then that it has been established that HALS is a useful and effective technique for the removal of spleens with a diameter larger than 20 cms. This is a principle mentioned also in more recent studies (Swanson et al. Can J Surg 2011; 54: 189-193, and in our recent review Misiakos et al. World J Gastrointest Endoc 2017; 9: 428-437). However HALS did not gain wide acceptance over the last 2 decades among surgeons, probably due to the complexity of the technique. The majority of studies implicating this technique support its usefulness for the removal of large spleens but almost none supports its use for every occasion. -The authors should change their title to a more moderate statement, such as "Hand-assisted laparoscopic splenectomy is a useful surgical treatment for patients with excessive splenomegaly: a meta-analysis" -The authors should better define the criteria for the use of its special technique and report some data about the cost aspect. -They should add that this technique requires special training and experience and should be used by experienced surgeons in general laparoscopic surgery. -They should better define when DUS is required. -The statistical interpretation of data is well performed. -The language needs minor language polishing. 1.

## **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

### ***Google Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No

### ***BPG Search:***

- ☐ The same title



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242

**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243

**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

**https://**www.wjgnet.com

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[ Y ] No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Clinical Cases

**Manuscript NO:** 43318

**Title:** Hand-assisted laparoscopic splenectomy is the ideal surgical treatment for patients with splenomegaly: a meta-analysis

**Reviewer's code:** 03887212

**Reviewer's country:** Italy

**Science editor:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Date sent for review:** 2018-11-08

**Date reviewed:** 2018-11-26

**Review time:** 18 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well-designed meta-analysis on HALS. Pooled analysis was well conducted and results are sound. I believe discussion may benefit of mentioning robotic splenectomy for splenomegaly as this may represent an alternative to HALS for treating this



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

condition in the near future.

#### INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

##### *Google Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

##### *BPG Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No