

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 44514

Title: Overexpression of HS 7 and HSP70 is associated with decreased survival among patients with esophageal adenocarcinoma

Reviewer's code: 01047558

Reviewer's country: Tunisia

Science editor: Ruo-Yu Ma

Date sent for review: 2018-11-19

Date reviewed: 2018-11-26

Review time: 7 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript "Overexpression of HSP27 and HSP70 is associated with decreased survival among patients with esophageal adenocarcinoma" is a retrospective study witch demonstrate that over expression of heat shock proteins (HSP) 27 and 70 in 96



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

patients with esophageal adenocarcinoma is associated with poor survival. Comments: - There was no statistical difference in staining frequency of HSP27 between cancer cases and Barrett's esophagus and control cases but there was correlation between staining frequency of HSP27 and survival??? This must be discussed. - According to tables 2 and 3, tumor stage and HSP expression seems to be correlated but you confirmed that tumor stage did not correlate with HSP. This results must been shown. - Tumor stage and HSP expression were a strong prognostic factor of survival independently and in results you mentioned that: "HigherHSP27 and HSP70 expressions remained an independent negative prognostic factor, and cancer stage was the only analyzed confounder that was significantly associated with survival." - The number of references in the text needs to be reviewed - The legend of tables is missing

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 44514

Title: Overexpression of HS 7 and HSP70 is associated with decreased survival among patients with esophageal adenocarcinoma

Reviewer's code: 03807845

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Ruo-Yu Ma

Date sent for review: 2018-11-19

Date reviewed: 2018-11-27

Review time: 7 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This study is interesting. I have some major comments: 1, This is a study of immunoreactivity of HSP27 and 70 in esophageal adenocarcinoma, IHC pictures showing excellent IHC quality should be included. 2, The used TMA (1mm) samples



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

are too small and the tumor cells can be lost or only rare tumor cells present in a proportion of samples after IHC procedure. A few tumor cells may not be representative. How to define the 85% success in cancer sample and 50% in BE? Some stained cells may not be tumor cells. The interpretation of the results should be blindly made by experienced GI pathologists. More description and evidences are needed. 3, The HSP27 and 70 immunoreactivities were evaluated by one experienced observer. Who was the observer? Not by pathologists? 4, The tissue thickness was 3-5 um. How many cases were 3, 4 or 5 um, respectively? This may also affect the IHC results. 5, Why 1.5 was used for the cutoff?

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 44514

Title: Overexpression of HS Y7 and HSP70 is associated with decreased survival among patients with esophageal adenocarcinoma

Reviewer's code: 03259445

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ruo-Yu Ma

Date sent for review: 2018-11-19

Date reviewed: 2018-11-28

Review time: 8 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Thank you for giving me the chance to review this interesting manuscript. The authors investigated the association of expression of HSP 27 and HSP 70 with survival in patients with esophageal adenocarcinoma (EAC). I enjoyed reviewing this manuscript.



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

Although the theory and data of this article were very interesting as basic science, the data were not sufficiently persuasive to prove the association between HSP27/70 and survival. The authors had better describe about the potential efficacy of the HSP27/70 for clinical decision making for EAC treatment. Therefore, the authors should add and show subgroup analysis about clinical stages and kinds of treatment at least.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No