Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 46556

Title: Microbial metabolites in non-alcoholic fatty liver disease

Reviewer's code: 04091933

Reviewer's country: Russia

Science editor: Ruo-Yu Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-02-22 06:44

Reviewer performed review: 2019-03-02 12:21

Review time: 8 Days and 5 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	[ ] Accept (High priority)	Peer-Review:
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Accept (General priority)	[Y] Anonymous
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[Y] Minor revision	[ ] Onymous
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Major revision	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
[ ] Grade E: Do not publish		[ ] Rejection	[Y] Advanced
			[ ] General
			[ ] No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			[ ] Yes
			[Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript is very relevant, given the increasing incidence and prevalence of NAFLD, the lack of reliable and informative non-invasive biomarkers for diagnosis and prognosis, and the ineffectiveness of the available treatment. However, given the manuscript title, the review is incomplete. Many important metabolites are not

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

represented or are not fully described (including tryptophan metabolites, branched-chain amino acids (BCAAs), endotoxin, etc.). There is a discrepancy between the abstract, the figure and the text: for example, the indole propionic acid (IPA) mentioned in the abstract is not discussed in the text, the indole is presented only in the figure, two other tryptophan metabolites are only discussed. The section 'Other microbial metabolites' misleads the reader, since most of the metabolites discussed are not microbial (endogenous metabolite dimethylguanidino valeric acid, endocannabinoid anandamide) or human microbiota products (nonsteroidal fungal metabolite altenusin). In the same section, for some unknown reason, the microbial metabolite deoxycholic acid (DCA) is discussed, although the section 'Bile Acids' is present above. The microbial origin of metabolites is practically not discussed (specific metabolite-producing taxa are not indicated), it also reduces the value of the manuscript. Given the experience and competence of the authors, the article is rated as good and may be published, but only after revision.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

[Y] No

Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 46556

Title: Microbial metabolites in non-alcoholic fatty liver disease

Reviewer's code: 02544416

Reviewer's country: Serbia

Science editor: Ruo-Yu Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-03-14 11:47

Reviewer performed review: 2019-03-17 05:39

Review time: 2 Days and 17 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	[ ] Accept (High priority)	Peer-Review:
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[Y] Accept (General priority)	[Y] Anonymous
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Minor revision	[ ] Onymous
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Major revision	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
[ ] Grade E: Do not publish		[ ] Rejection	[Y] Advanced
			[ ] General
			[ ] No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			[ ] Yes
			[Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

With exception of type errors, the manuscript entitled "Microbial metabolites in nonalcoholic fatty liver disease" is a well structured and presented review where current knowledge in this topic is adequately presented and given conclusions are of high scientific and clinical value.

Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No