

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 46613

Title: Relationship between circulating irisin levels and overweight/obesity: A meta-analysis

Reviewer's code: 03465354

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-04-01 14:22

Reviewer performed review: 2019-04-08 18:23

Review time: 7 Days and 4 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Proposed manuscript by Jia and co-authors is a meta-analysis investigating the relationship between circulating irisin levels and overweight/obesity based on 18 published studies (1,005 cases and 1,242 controls). Results from the meta-analysis



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

showed that in African (but not European, Asian or American) population, the circulating levels of irisin in overweight or obese population were significantly higher compared to those in normal-weight controls. Also, higher circulating irisin levels are observed in obese, compared to normal-weight children (from all racial groups). The topic of this analysis is interesting, since the data and the general knowledge on the functions of irisin is very scarce. Current analysis is based on small amount of data, not enough to make firm conclusions (4 studies demonstrated lower irisin levels in overweight/obese individuals compared to normal-weight controls, 9 publications found the opposite, 5 showed no statistically significant effect). Still, in my opinion as a peer reviewer, such a summarization is useful. This study uses different racial groups using the same BMI criteria but it needs to be noted that weight stratification in the Asian population is based on different BMI values.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 46613

Title: Relationship between circulating irisin levels and overweight/obesity: A meta-analysis

Reviewer's code: 03469767

Reviewer's country: Iran

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-04-06 08:05

Reviewer performed review: 2019-04-11 04:58

Review time: 4 Days and 20 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Introduction Definition of obesity in first line should be complete. The reference for prevalence for obesity should be update (ref 2). Previous meta-analysis or systematic review regarding to irisin should be given Description of irisin, this cytokines secrete by



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

muscle tissue?? And related to obesity? The reference for the sentences after “.... That have been reported”. The Scopus should be search for this meta-analysis. Number of Prospero. Why this study only limit for English articles Inclusion and exclusion criteria did not acceptable It is not clear that this meta-analysis was conducted for adults or children It should better that subgroup analysis done according to age. Why both random and fixed effect was use?????????????

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No