



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 46852

Title: Recurrent renal cell carcinoma leading to a misdiagnosis of polycystic liver disease:
A case report

Reviewer’s code: 03656596

Reviewer’s country: China

Science editor: Ruo-Yu Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-03-06 11:43

Reviewer performed review: 2019-03-28 04:26

Review time: 21 Days and 16 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

From the information provided by the case, it is very easy to be confused clinically. The publication of this article is meaningful.



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 46852

Title: Recurrent renal cell carcinoma leading to a misdiagnosis of polycystic liver disease:
A case report

Reviewer's code: 03317331

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Ruo-Yu Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-03-29 06:56

Reviewer performed review: 2019-03-31 12:44

Review time: 2 Days and 5 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting case report about the cystic liver metastasis of renal cell carcinoma. I have some comments: 1. Because ths patient has bilateral lobes of liver cysts in 4 years ago (before operation for left renal cell carcinoma), the image of previous abdominal CT



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

should be presented. Then we could compare the change of liver cystic lesions between 4 years ago (before resection of left left renal cell carcinoma) and current status (before hepatectomy for "cystic" metastatic renal cell carcinoma). 2. If liver cysts (or cystic tumors) have been existed for 4 years, it is possible that renal cell carcinoma has been "cystic" metastatis to liver in 4 years ago. Or it is just a condition that renal cell carcinoma develops metastasis in a liver with polycytic liver disease (PCLD). The author should elucidate these conditions because there was no "cystic" liver metastasis reported in PRCC patients. 3. This patient received an operation (liver right lobectomy) for recurrent hemorrhage of liver cysts. The author though this operation might be avoid if the diagnosis of metastatic RCC could be made before operation. But how to get a correct pre-operation diagnosis for a patient with polycystic liver disease? Repeated fine needle aspiration for cytology study or core biopsy for pathologic examination? And how to treat the symptom of abdominal pain for this patient if liver cytic metastasis diagnosed before operation? The author should be further explained in the discussion section. 4. Could the author further report the prognosis of this patient after operations for right lobe hepatectomy and cyst fenestration? According to the current report, the patient started sunitinib treatment 1 month after the hepatectomy. If the pain was relived and the life quality was improved for this patient?

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- [] The same title
- [] Duplicate publication
- [] Plagiarism
- [Y] No



Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No