



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Stem Cells

**Manuscript NO:** 47254

**Title:** Effect of poly(3-hydroxyalkanoates) as natural polymers on mesenchymal stem cells

**Reviewer's code:** 03372822

**Reviewer's country:** Portugal

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-03-20 18:50

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-03-26 14:42

**Review time:** 5 Days and 19 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The authors address an interesting topic in their review. However, the review is overall very uneven and unfocused on the proposed subject which is mesenchymal stem cells and natural poly(3-hydroxyalkanoates). To extrapolate some reactions observed in vivo



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

in mammalian tissues with these materials, the authors give examples of naturally occurring functions of in many organisms, but the link and conclusions raised from these observations are not clearly drawn. The manuscript could gain by organizing in it in defined sections with appropriate section titles. The discussion/conclusion is merely a summary of what was exposed extensively in the main text body. Perhaps a discussion on how the authors think these problems/events can be solved or adapted to better achieve potential therapies would be welcome.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Stem Cells

**Manuscript NO:** 47254

**Title:** Effect of poly(3-hydroxyalkanoates) as natural polymers on mesenchymal stem cells

**Reviewer's code:** 00567975

**Reviewer's country:** Austria

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-03-24 18:34

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-04-01 15:31

**Review time:** 7 Days and 20 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This is an interesting review about the effect of natural poly(3-hydroxyalkanoates, PHAs) on mesenchymal stem cells. The topic of review is important, since bioengineering approaches for bone regeneration are intensively investigated. Review summarizes some



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

studies in the effect of PHAs on mesenchymal stem cells. However, the manuscript requires an intensive revision before it can be recommended for a publication. The major concern is that the manuscript contains too much information, which is not directly related to the topic of review. 1. Introduction section is too long and can be shortened by about half. 2. Chapter 2. Here the main question of review (as suggested by title) is considered. However, it is not clear why do Authors included studies on MG-63 cells, human osteoblasts etc? The aim of the review is the effect of PHAs on MSCs and Authors need to follow this aim. Furthermore, this section needs to be more structured, to show the effect of PHAs on the different aspects of MSCs physiology like proliferation, osteogenic, adipogenic, chondrogenic differentiation. In the current version, presentation is quite chaotic and unclear for the readers 3. Chapter 3. Most information presented in this chapter is not directly related to the topic of Review. There are several paragraphs, which do not touch the topic of MSCs at all. All information, which is not related to the topic must be skipped or at least substantially shortened.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](https://www.wjgnet.com)

[Y] No



## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Stem Cells

**Manuscript NO:** 47254

**Title:** Effect of poly(3-hydroxyalkanoates) as natural polymers on mesenchymal stem cells

**Reviewer's code:** 02446177

**Reviewer's country:** Germany

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-03-26 09:38

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-04-03 16:41

**Review time:** 8 Days and 7 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors present an extensive literature review about the biological effects of PHAs and its scaffolds on mesenchymal stem cells. The manuscript is well written and the table provides a good overview of the literature findings.



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](https://www.wjgnet.com)

#### INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

##### *Google Search:*

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- [Y] No

##### *BPG Search:*

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- [Y] No