

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 47295

Title: Imaging biomarkers for the treatment of esophageal cancer

Reviewer's code: 00812852

Reviewer's country: Iran

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-03-27 17:38

Reviewer performed review: 2019-03-27 19:59

Review time: 2 Hours

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY | LANGUAGE QUALITY | CONCLUSION | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS |
|--|---|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept | Peer-Review: |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language | (High priority) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of | (General priority) | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not | language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript: |
| publish | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> General |
| | | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
| | | | Conflicts-of-Interest: |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes |
| | | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article is interesting . If it included the biomarkers on sonography both transcutaneous and EUS it would be more comprehensive.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 47295

Title: Imaging biomarkers for the treatment of esophageal cancer

Reviewer's code: 00731523

Reviewer's country: Iran

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-03-29 14:07

Reviewer performed review: 2019-03-29 14:25

Review time: 1 Hour

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY | LANGUAGE QUALITY | CONCLUSION | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS |
|--|--|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | Peer-Review: |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language | (High priority) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of | (General priority) | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not | language polishing | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript: |
| publish | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
| | | | Conflicts-of-Interest: |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes |
| | | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This article reviews the imaging biomarkers as a predicting tool only for response to chemo- or chemoradiotherapy not response to surgery. The title should be changed due to this concept. You should add a conclusion at each section. Also, it's better to discuss about the relation of these biomarkers to the pathologic type (i.e. SCC or



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

adenocarcinoma), the location of the tumor (upper, middle and lower third) and the clinical condition of the patient.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 47295

Title: Imaging biomarkers for the treatment of esophageal cancer

Reviewer's code: 03026970

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-03-25 01:48

Reviewer performed review: 2019-04-02 13:49

Review time: 8 Days and 12 Hours

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY | LANGUAGE QUALITY | CONCLUSION | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS |
|---|---|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | Peer-Review: |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language | (High priority) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of | (General priority) | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not | language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript: |
| publish | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
| | | | Conflicts-of-Interest: |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes |
| | | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review concluded the features of CT / MR perfusion, texture analysis, DWI, and PET as biomarkers in predicting the treatment response or prognosis of esophageal cancer. Imaging biomarkers, featured by availability and less invasiveness, offer clinical doctors an option in esophageal cancer diagnosis. The whole passage is well-organized.

However, there are still some problems need to be discussed. 1. There is a review in 2017 discussed the endoscopic and imaging predictors in assessing the pathologic response after chemoradiation for esophageal cancer (Endoscopic and Imaging Predictors of Complete Pathologic Response After Chemoradiation for Esophageal Cancer). Besides, only 1/4 references quoted in this review were published in the last 5 years. This review is lack of novelty and needs thorough discussion. 2. It was mentioned in the article that published results about relationship of CT / MR perfusion and angiogenesis are controversial. Could you please provide specific reference and discuss it? 3. It is recommended to add the limitations and challenges of diffusion-weighted MRI. 4. Some abbreviations are confusing and the full name should be provided at the first appearance. Such as CRT, BF and ROI. 5. There is no "A" or "B" in the picture of Figure 3. 6. There are several grammar mistakes in this review.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No