Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 47571

Title: Growth arrest-specific gene 2 suppresses hepatocarcinogenesis by intervention of cell cycle and p53-dependent apoptosis

Reviewer's code: 02861175

Reviewer's country: Indonesia

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-03-28 15:49

Reviewer performed review: 2019-03-28 18:06

Review time: 2 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Very good [Y] Grade C: Good [ ] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing [ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Accept (High priority) [Y] Accept (General priority) [ ] Minor revision [ ] Major revision [ ] Rejection	Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous [ ] Onymous Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript: [ ] Advanced [Y] General [ ] No expertise Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. There were not consistence between Title - study aim- hypothesis - conclusion 2. This article was not the novel study as mention o the article .... "Over all, our diverse functional assays revealed a novel molecular mechanism underlying the

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

anti-proliferative nature of GAS2 in hepatocyte and HCC cell line". Zhu R et al. J Pathol 2015; 237: 38–49 published an article with the title " Truncated HBx-dependent silencing of GAS2 promotes hepatocarcinogenesis through deregulation of cell cycle, senescence and p53-mediated apoptosis " 3. there was not sequence mentioning to mRNA GAS2 target.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 47571

Title: Growth arrest-specific gene 2 suppresses hepatocarcinogenesis by intervention of cell cycle and p53-dependent apoptosis

Reviewer's code: 00697631

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-03-29 03:42

Reviewer performed review: 2019-04-04 08:56

Review time: 6 Days and 5 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Very good [Y] Grade C: Good [ ] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing [ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Accept (High priority) [ ] Accept (General priority) [ ] Minor revision [Y] Major revision [ ] Rejection	Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous [ ] Onymous Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript: [ ] Advanced [Y] General [ ] No expertise Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

RE: Manuscript NO: 47571 Zhu et al, Growth arrest-specific gene 2 suppresses hepatocarcinogenesis by intervention of cell cycle and p53-dependent apoptosis. Zhu et al investigated the role of GAS2 in liver cells and found that GAS inhibited the growth

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

of certain HCC cells in a p53-dependent manner. The authors further showed that GAS expression was down-regulated in clinical HCC samples compared to corresponding non-HCC liver tissue. The data presented here include interesting findings in HCC biology, however data are not enough to support the authors conclusion. The authors showed that GAS2 overexpression suppressed growth of SK-hep1 cells and knockdown of GAS2 in MIHA cells stimulated the proliferation. However, these experiments were conducted only in cell with wild type 53. Alteration of p53 gene is relatively common events in HCC, mutations of p53 that acquires dominant-negative function and deletion of p53 are reported. Therefore authors' conclusion seems to be too much extended and data are not enough to generalize the role of GAS2The in HCC. 1. Hep3B cells without p53 expressed GAS2(Fig 1A). What is the result of GAS2 knockdown in Hep3B cells? 2. There are no experiments in Huh7 and/or PLC5 cells that carry mutant p53 genes. These two cell lines do not express GAS2. Therefore overexpression of GAS2 is necessary to confirm whether it can suppress HCC cells with mutant p53.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

[Y] No