

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 47978

Title: Prediction of overall survival following colorectal cancer surgery in elderly patients

Reviewer's code: 00057659

Reviewer's country: Germany

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-04-02 05:21

Reviewer performed review: 2019-04-02 05:40

Review time: 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The percentage of elderly patients in our daily work is increasing. A good decision making and useful recomondations are helpful for our work. Therefor, preoperative scoring Systems should be evaluated. For colorectal cancer surgery, a lot of scores and



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

predictive factors are known. Unfortunately, this manuscript can not deliver new aspects. To use the tumor biology and CEA Levels to possibly exclude patients from surgery is very difficult.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 47978

Title: Prediction of overall survival following colorectal cancer surgery in elderly patients

Reviewer's code: 00044311

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-04-02 01:21

Reviewer performed review: 2019-04-10 15:31

Review time: 8 Days and 14 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Many elderly patients express age-related concerns when advised for operative intervention. Dr. Seow-En and colleagues aimed in this retrospective cohort study to integrate clinically significant prognostic factors relevant to elective colorectal surgery in

the elderly into a validated pre-operative scoring system. In their retrospective cohort study, patients aged 70 and above who underwent surgery for colorectal cancer at Singapore General Hospital between January 2005 and December 2012 were identified from a prospectively maintained database. Patients with evidence of metastatic disease, and those who underwent emergency surgery or had surgery for benign colorectal conditions were excluded from the analysis. The primary outcome was 3-year overall survival following surgery. A multivariate model predicting survival was derived and validated against an equivalent external surgical cohort. Statistical analyses were performed using Stata/MP Version 15.1. They observed the following multivariate analysis, as the factors significant for predicting overall mortality were serum albumin < 35 g/dL, serum carcinoembryonic antigen ≥ 20 $\mu\text{g/L}$, T stage 3 or 4, moderate tumor cell differentiation or worse, mucinous histology, rectal tumors, and pre-existing chronic obstructive lung disease. Interestingly, advanced age alone was not found to be significant. The main limitation of the study was selection bias, as patients who had undergone surgery would have tended to be physiologically fitter. They concluded that, this novel scoring system generates an individualized survival probability following colorectal resection and can assist in the decision-making process. Validation with an external population strengthens the generalizability of this model. The study was done in Singapore and South Korea under strict ethical protocol policy. The manuscript is well written and is easy to follow. The English language is excellent. The paper content is of quality educational value and is publishable in its current version.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

☐ Plagiarism

☒ No

BPG Search:

☐ The same title

☐ Duplicate publication

☐ Plagiarism

☒ No