

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 48524

Title: Value of controlled attenuation parameter in fibrosis prediction in nonalcoholic steatohepatitis

Reviewer's code: 03647461

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-04-24 13:29

Reviewer performed review: 2019-05-16 22:25

Review time: 22 Days and 8 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Grammatical errors are few but present. The exclusion criteria for NAFLD designation should have also included Wilson's disease, hemochromatosis, alpha-1 antitrypsin deficiency. Because of the subjective nature of histologic assessment, two pathologists



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

would have been better than one. The rationale or explanation used for calculating the cutoff values for fibrosis with respect to Cap tertiles is not clear. The calculation could potentially be used to reduce the effect of hepatic steatosis that are presented as CAP scores when LSM is used to predict fibrosis. It might also be arbitrary to apply these cutoff values to estimate the effect of pioglitazone and UDCA use on follow up LSM values performed 1 year after the treatment with the two drugs. Furthermore, matches were not made in the baseline demographic findings between pioglitazone and UDCA-treated groups, which might skew the findings. In the Discussion section, the possible effect of other treatment drugs on LSM-CAP estimations of fibrosis and steatosis has not been mentioned even though for this study, it would suffice to use these two drugs. Also, there was no mention of the current tools used to assess both steatosis and fibrosis (MRI-PDFF and MRE, respectively) and how they would compare with the LSM and CAP applications.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 48524

Title: Value of controlled attenuation parameter in fibrosis prediction in nonalcoholic steatohepatitis

Reviewer's code: 03576082

Reviewer's country: Mexico

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-05-23 15:45

Reviewer performed review: 2019-06-03 23:24

Review time: 11 Days and 7 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The Manuscript No 48524, titled the value of control attenuation parameter in fibrosis prediction in nonalcoholic steatohepatitis is an interesting article that compares in a population with NASH the degree of fibrosis by two methodologies: a) liver biopsy and



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

b) the use of transient elastography (TE) fibroscan to measure LIVER stiffness measurement (LSM) with a software controlled attenuation parameter (CAP) to measure liver fibrosis. The authors found a good correlation between the grade of fibrosis using the Kleiner fibrosis stage (F0-1). The authors also compared the fibrosis after the treatment between pioglitazone and ursodeoxycholic acid (UDCA). They found that patients treated with pioglitazone demonstrated decrease in fibrosis after a year of treatment when that in UDCA treated patients did not show significant changes. The authors conclude in NASH patients the combination of LSM with CAP scores may provide helpful information about the grade of fibrosis. I consider that is an interesting study with good results using the LSM with CAP software. It is important to have diagnostic tools alternative to liver biopsy and ET is one of them. I recommend the manuscript for publication.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 48524

Title: Value of controlled attenuation parameter in fibrosis prediction in nonalcoholic steatohepatitis

Reviewer's code: 02539179

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-05-23 15:03

Reviewer performed review: 2019-06-15 16:06

Review time: 23 Days and 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper is well written. The study is informative in drawing a conclusion that LSM in NASH may overestimate stages of liver fibrosis especially in patients with high CAP values. Interpretation of LSM considering simultaneously measured CAP scores may



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

provide more helpful information sparing unnecessary liver biopsy in NAFLD patients.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No