

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

Manuscript NO: 48635

Title: Failure Patterns of pT3-4N0-3M0 Esophageal Squamous Cell Carcinoma Patients with or without Post-operative Radiotherapy

Reviewer's code: 00058340

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Jin-Lei Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-06-19 08:22

Reviewer performed review: 2019-06-23 20:28

Review time: 4 Days and 12 Hours

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY | LANGUAGE QUALITY | CONCLUSION | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS |
|--|---|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | Peer-Review: |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language | (High priority) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of | (General priority) | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not | language polishing | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript: |
| publish | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
| | | | Conflicts-of-Interest: |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes |
| | | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors compared the differences in outcomes of treatment - surgical (S) with or without post-operative radiotherapy (S+R) after esophagectomy for patient with dpT3-4N0-3M0 esophageal squamous cell carcinoma. They found that the difference in

the median DFS between S+R arm vs. S arm was statistically significant (12.7 vs. 8 months, $p=0.048$). However, patients in the S arm had a significantly higher rate of locoregional recurrence and a lower rate of distant metastases than those in the S+R arm. These are interesting findings. The results – higher rate of distant metastases in the S+R arm, if confirmed on a larger patient population opens an important question regarding mechanisms. Comments 1. The title is too complicated for the general readership. Please simplify e.g. Surgical vs surgical/radiotherapy treatment of dpT3-4N0-3M0 esophageal cancer. Differences in survival, recurrence and metastasis. or similar 2. On page 7 the authors stated “Chemotherapy. After surgery or radiotherapy was completed, chemotherapy was scheduled intravenously with cisplatin (25 mg/m²/d, d1-3) and 5-fluorouracil (5-Fu, 600 mg/m²/d, d1-5) or paclitaxel (135-175 mg/m²/d, d1) for four cycles with an interval of 3-4 weeks. Clearly an explanation is required whether this treatment was applied to all patients in this study. 3. In Figures 2-4 the units for vertical -Y axis should be clearly spelled out the units and figure legends should be more precisely worded. In Figure 2 celiac is misspelled. 4. The paper requires careful stylistic and linguistic revisions. For example, the statement “All authors helped to perform the research” would imply that someone else performed the main research and authors only helped. I suggest to reword this statement, e.g. all authors participated in this research and list the capacity.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- [] The same title
- [] Duplicate publication
- [] Plagiarism
- [Y] No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<https://www.wjgnet.com>

BPG Search:

[] The same title

[] Duplicate publication

[] Plagiarism

[Y] No