



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 48753

**Title:** Impact of the national Human Development Index on liver cancer outcomes:  
Transition from 2008 to 2018

**Reviewer's code:** 03648086

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-05-29 11:30

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-06-02 18:22

**Review time:** 4 Days and 6 Hours

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY                                     | LANGUAGE QUALITY   | CONCLUSION   | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS                      |
|--|--|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                    | Peer-Review:                                  |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language                 | (High priority)                                    | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good                 | polishing  | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                    | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous              |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of                | (General priority)                                 | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the              |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not               | language polishing   | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript:                      |
| publish  | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection                      | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision            | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced             |
|  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                 | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General   |
|  |  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise         |
|  |  |  | Conflicts-of-Interest:                        |
|  |  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes                  |
|  |  |  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No        |

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This study aimed to determine the influence of the Human Development Index on indicators of clinical outcomes for patients with liver cancer. The authors compared the difference between two specific years (2018 and 2008) spanning a decade. In the end, the



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

study provides evidence claiming a positive association between the outcome of liver cancer and the socioeconomic status. While the study provides interesting findings to public health field, some minor issues/changes in the manuscript might improve the overall quality of the manuscript: 1. Would the authors be able to justify why choosing the 15% cutoff for an increase and decrease in the MIR value (the mortality-to-incidence ratio) when describing the transition from 2008 to 2018 (In results section 3.3 and Fig 3a)? 2. Figure 2 and 3 are showing very important data points. In order to improve the overall intuition, the authors should keep a consistent color schema in figures. Could authors use RED for the data points of 2018, and BLUE for those of 2008 in Figure 2a-e (“e” is missing in the current version) and in Figure 3b? The same color change could be made for word “2018” and “2008” in the figures. 3. In addition, the parts (a -e) in Figure 2 are too crowded. More space should be available if the authors intend to make it a 2-column figure.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 48753

**Title:** Impact of the national Human Development Index on liver cancer outcomes:  
Transition from 2008 to 2018

**Reviewer's code:** 03476433

**Reviewer's country:** Colombia

**Science editor:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-05-29 10:39

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-06-02 23:05

**Review time:** 4 Days and 12 Hours

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY                          | LANGUAGE QUALITY                                      | CONCLUSION                              | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS              |
|---|---|---|---------------------------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept         | Peer-Review:                          |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language      | (High priority)                         | <input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous    |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good      | polishing   | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept         | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous      |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair      | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of     | (General priority)                      | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the      |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not    | language polishing                                    | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript:              |
| publish                                     | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection           | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced     |
|   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection      | <input type="checkbox"/> General      |
|   |   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
|   |   |   | Conflicts-of-Interest:                |
|   |   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes          |
|   |   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> No           |

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Congratulations for this great work, I enjoy very much reading your work, the information presented in is very valuable for other researchers.



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://www.wjgnet.com**

**INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

***Google Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

***BPG Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 48753

**Title:** Impact of the national Human Development Index on liver cancer outcomes:  
Transition from 2008 to 2018

**Reviewer's code:** 02998194

**Reviewer's country:** Greece

**Science editor:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-05-31 10:09

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-06-08 09:07

**Review time:** 7 Days and 22 Hours

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY                                     | LANGUAGE QUALITY  | CONCLUSION                                 | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS                      |
|--|---|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing       | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept            | Peer-Review:                                  |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language | (High priority)                            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good                 | polishing   | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous              |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of           | (General priority)                         | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the              |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not               | language polishing  | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision    | topic of the manuscript:                      |
| publish  | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision    | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced             |
|  |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection         | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General   |
|  |   |  | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise         |
|  |   |  | Conflicts-of-Interest:                        |
|  |   |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes                  |
|  |   |  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No        |

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This is a thorough epidemiological study about HCC. The only thing I would like to mention is that a noticeable part of discussion is about details of treatment of HCC which are not mentioned before.



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

#### INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

##### *Google Search:*

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

##### *BPG Search:*

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No