

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 50735

Title: The therapeutic potential of menstrual blood stem cells treating acute liver failure

Reviewer's code: 03727922

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, MSc, PhD

Professional title: Doctor, Medical Assistant, Postdoc, Professor, Research Assistant
Professor, Research Scientist, Staff Physician, Surgeon, Surgical Oncologist

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Author's country: China

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-08-21 12:53

Reviewer performed review: 2019-08-21 13:26

Review time: 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Well done manuscript, however I suggest some important points. In the methods: 1 - Inform the precise date and year of the Ethical approval; 2- I suggest you to perform other control group - with only the ALF, because you done only two groups the case and the sham; 3 - Is necessary to describe better the surgical procedure and the intraportally stem cell administration. Discussion: 1- Need to clarify the benefits of your study to the clinical practice and if will able to perform in clinical practice and translate to the medicine.; 2- Very important to better describe the limitations of your study.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 50735

Title: The therapeutic potential of menstrual blood stem cells treating acute liver failure

Reviewer's code: 00503536

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's country: Japan

Author's country: China

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-08-20 01:53

Reviewer performed review: 2019-08-25 02:41

Review time: 5 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript written by Pan-Pan Cen et al. describes the therapeutic effects of

menstrual blood stem cells (MenSCs) in an animal model of acute liver failure. Acute liver failure is a fetal disease and there is few effective treatment. Therefore, the data is interesting and important. However, there are some concerns that need to be addressed. Major points, 1. As shown in Fig 5, survival time of MenSCs in vivo is short (2 days). What do the authors think the mechanism for the short survival? If the in vivo survival could be longer, the therapeutic effect of MenSCs would be better. 2. The mechanism of the effect of injected MenSCs is unclear. Do the injected MenSCs produce human albumin, which can be measured in the blood? Are there any interactions between injected MenSCs and pig's hepatocytes? Do the injected MenSCs produce proteins that regulate immunity of pigs or protect pig's hepatocytes? 3. Dose response effects of injected MenSCs should be shown in order to prove the therapeutic effects. Minor points, 1. How many cells can be harvested from menstrual blood cells? The authors should add the data.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com