



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 51183

Title: Successful Orthotopic Liver Transplantation for Acute Sickle Cell Intrahepatic Cholestasis: Case Report and Literature Review

Reviewer's code: 02728252

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's country: Egypt

Author's country: United States

Reviewer chosen by: Artificial Intelligence Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-09-14 03:38

Reviewer performed review: 2019-09-15 08:15

Review time: 1 Day and 4 Hours

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY | LANGUAGE QUALITY | CONCLUSION | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS |
|--|---|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | Peer-Review: |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language | (High priority) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of | (General priority) | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not | language polishing | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript: |
| publish | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
| | | | Conflicts-of-Interest: |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes |
| | | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

It is an interesting case report of successful orthotopic liver transplantation for acute sickle cell intrahepatic cholestasis. Minor corrections are needed especially in the references section.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 51183

Title: Successful Orthotopic Liver Transplantation for Acute Sickle Cell Intrahepatic Cholestasis: Case Report and Literature Review

Reviewer's code: 04356732

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MBBS

Professional title: Associate Professor, Reader (Associate Professor)

Reviewer's country: Nigeria

Author's country: United States

Reviewer chosen by: Ruo-Yu Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-09-16 17:13

Reviewer performed review: 2019-09-21 23:17

Review time: 5 Days and 6 Hours

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY | LANGUAGE QUALITY | CONCLUSION | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS |
|---|---|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | Peer-Review: |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language | (High priority) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of | (General priority) | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not | language polishing | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript: |
| publish | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
| | | | Conflicts-of-Interest: |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes |
| | | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

REVIEWER'S REPORT FOR MANUSCRIPT (CASE REPORT) RE- SUCCESSFUL
ORTHOTOPIC LIVER TRANSPLANTATION FOR ACUTE SICKLE CELL
INTRAHEPATIC CHOLESTASIS: CASE REPORT AND LITERATURE REVIEW General

comments The authors reported a case of a 29 year-old male with history of vaso-occlusive pain crisis, who presented with clinical and laboratory features suggestive of acute liver injury and acute kidney injury. Within two weeks of hospitalization (inferred from the authors' stated time frame), patient had undergone a successful orthotopic liver transplantation from a HCV donor, and received post-operative medications for the positive HCV RNA testing. Clinical outcome was said to be satisfactory on follow-up. Although the report was an interesting evidence of an apparently- successful therapeutic intervention for a potentially-fatal complication in sickle cell disease, I have the following concerns about the manuscript Major concerns 1. In the Abstract, the second sentence under Case Summary read 'On examination, he had jaundice with soft non-tender abdomen, initially he was alert and oriented then later became confused.' I think the statement is ambiguous. The reader would like to understand the time frame within which the change in sensorium had occurred. The clinical progression should be captured well. See also a similar statement under Case Report viz 'He was jaundiced and initially was alert and oriented to person, place and time. His abdomen was soft with no tenderness or organomegaly and had normal bowel sounds. He later became confused.' 2.

Pre-surgery, it appeared the patient was in a critical state as stated by the authors thus: 'He was admitted to the medical intensive liver unit (MILU) for further management. He received 2 units of platelets and 4 units of fresh frozen plasma (FFP). He was intubated for acute respiratory failure secondary to acute chest syndrome.....' Since OLT is a complex procedure requiring painstaking pre-operative preparation and intra-operative meticulous implantation, one wonders how the patient successfully



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

underwent the procedure within the reported short time frame. Was a total organ transplantation done? From a cadaveric or from a live donor? 3. Based on the objective of this review, I think the Discussion section should have started with this paragraph: 'There is a total of 22 reported liver transplant cases in SCD patients. Majority of transplant cases are indicated for liver failure secondary to acute sickle cell intrahepatic cholestasis. 1 Only two case series about OLT in SCD patients are present in the literature. The first included six transplanted patients with 1-, 5- and 10-year survival rates of 83.3%, 44.4% and 44.4% respectively. 6 The other series reported 3 pediatric patients who were followed up for a mean of 4.3 years and survival rate was 66% 9. Indeed, these results are not too far from survival rates of non SCD patients undergoing OLT with 5- and 10-year survival rates of 71% and 61% respectively. 11' The authors can now bring in their own experience with the current case report for comparison..... 4. Overall, the Discussion section was not presented in a logical fashion. There was a lot of redundant information occupying several paragraphs. The authors should have presented a more concise prose focusing on the objective of this case report which was to highlight the role of OLT as a therapeutic measure for acute liver failure secondary to sickle cell intra-hepatic biliary cholestasis. 5. Tables 1 & 2 were not properly presented. The tables should not be ambiguous and should be self-explanatory. I suggest the authors redo both tables, with the title of table 1 placed on top not below the table Minor concerns 1.

The authors should be consistent with the use of terminology. For instance, the terms 'acute kidney injury' and 'acute renal failure' were used interchangeably. Acute kidney injury is the more current terminology. 2. Few syntax errors should be corrected. 3.

No subheading indicating 'References' was seen

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No