



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 51677

Title: Tailored eradication versus empirical bismuth-containing quadruple therapy as first-line Helicobacter eradication: A comparative, open trial

Reviewer’s code: 00503623

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer’s country: United States

Author’s country: South Korea

Reviewer chosen by: Artificial Intelligence Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-09-27 14:17

Reviewer performed review: 2019-09-27 15:35

Review time: 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

The manuscript, 51677, reports the results of comparative studies, conducted with over 150 Hp-positive patients, on the efficacy of TR strategy based on the presence of a 23S ribosomal RNA point mutation that causes CAM resistance with those based on the empirical bismuth-based quadruple therapy (EBQT). The findings revealed that the efficacy of TR was similar to that of EBQT. However, the side effect profile of TR was significantly better than that of EBQT. Based on the obtained results, it is suggested that TR should be considered as an effective tool in designing therapies for Hp eradication which do not require the use of difficult to comply bismuth-based quadruple therapy. Obvious concern is that the TR design would increase the costs of treatment.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 51677

Title: Tailored eradication versus empirical bismuth-containing quadruple therapy as first-line Helicobacter eradication: A comparative, open trial

Reviewer's code: 03009411

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's country: China

Author's country: South Korea

Reviewer chosen by: Artificial Intelligence Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-09-27 10:04

Reviewer performed review: 2019-09-28 07:36

Review time: 21 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Helicobacter pylori infection is increasingly difficult to treat mainly due to antibiotic resistance, especially to clarithromycin resistance. The authors have compared the efficacies, safety profiles, and compliance rates between a TR strategy based on the presence of a 23S ribosomal RNA point mutation and the empirical bismuth-based quadruple therapy (EBQT) as first-line eradication for H. pylori infection in Korean patients. They found the first-line eradication rate did not statistically differ between the two groups. However, the rate of side effects was significantly lower in TR than EBQT strategy. Although the sample size of this study was not big, but it can suggest that the TR strategy is worth further exploring. There are some problems: 1. About the eradication regimens: "The PAC regimen consisted of 30 mg lansoprazole + 500 mg CAM + 1,000 mg AMX, administered twice daily for 7 or 14 days." How to determine whether the course of treatment is 7 days or 14 days? 2. How many patients who reported adverse events were treated with the BQT regiment or with the PAC regimen in RT group, respectively? 3. In paragraph 1 of the discussion section: "In this prospective, open-label, comparative study, we compared the efficacies and safety profiles between the TR strategy, based on the presence of a 23S ribosomal RNA point mutation (n = 100), and the EBQT stratify (n = 50) as first-line eradication strategies for H. pylori infection in Korea." Whether the numbers are right? The word "stratify" is misspelled?

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 51677

Title: Tailored eradication versus empirical bismuth-containing quadruple therapy as first-line Helicobacter eradication: A comparative, open trial

Reviewer’s code: 00050195

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MA, MD, MSc

Professional title: Associate Professor, Senior Lecturer

Reviewer’s country: Israel

Author’s country: South Korea

Reviewer chosen by: Artificial Intelligence Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-09-27 12:47

Reviewer performed review: 2019-10-03 02:32

Review time: 5 Days and 13 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

The authors have written an important paper regarding treatment of HP infection. They show that treatment based on the detection of 23S rRNA mutations improves the success rate of HP eradication on a older regimen with less side-effects. The authors address the small sample number and the limitation to a specific population. The study is well conceived and the methodology is robust. My only comment is that I think there should be a discussion of the cost effectiveness of this approach. Ultimately this will have an effect on its adoption.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No