



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 51737

Title: Outcomes associated with the intention of loco-regional therapy prior to living donor liver transplantation for hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer’s code: 02687374

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer’s country: China

Author’s country: Taiwan

Reviewer chosen by: Artificial Intelligence Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-10-05 01:19

Reviewer performed review: 2019-10-10 15:07

Review time: 5 Days and 13 Hours

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY | LANGUAGE QUALITY | CONCLUSION | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS |
|---|---|---|---------------------------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | Peer-Review: |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language | (High priority) | <input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of | (General priority) | Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not | language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript: |
| publish | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> General |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
| | | | Conflicts-of-Interest: |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No |

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

This study analyzed patients who underwent living donor liver transplantation (LDL) for hepatocellular carcinoma to investigate the outcome in relation to the intention of pre-transplantation loco-regional therapy. And the result showed that achieving profound TN by loco-regional therapy could offer better outcomes for patients undergoing LDLT for HCC. This study yields a more novel conclusion which providing additional information to optimize therapeutic strategies for patients with HCC. Overall, this retrospective study design was more reasonable. The language of this manuscript was quite appropriate and references were also suitable. Therefore, I recommend accepting this manuscript.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 51737

Title: Outcomes associated with the intention of loco-regional therapy prior to living donor liver transplantation for hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 02539179

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: PhD, MD

Professional title: Chief Doctor, Professor

Reviewer's country: China

Author's country: Taiwan

Reviewer chosen by: Artificial Intelligence Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-10-05 23:50

Reviewer performed review: 2019-10-10 15:32

Review time: 4 Days and 15 Hours

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY | LANGUAGE QUALITY | CONCLUSION | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS |
|---|---|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | Peer-Review: |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language | (High priority) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of | (General priority) | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not | language polishing | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript: |
| publish | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
| | | | Conflicts-of-Interest: |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes |
| | | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

The study is overall informative in analyzing the impact of loco-regional therapy prior to living donor liver transplantation (LDLT) on the patients' outcomes. The results showed that patients with defined profound tumor necrosis (TN) by loco-regional therapy had a superior RFS (5-year of 93.8%) as compared with others. The underlying mechanisms of this phenomenon should be discussed. The clinical guidance significance of this finding should be clarified more clearly.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 51737

Title: Outcomes associated with the intention of loco-regional therapy prior to living donor liver transplantation for hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 02438768

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's country: China

Author's country: Taiwan

Reviewer chosen by: Artificial Intelligence Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-10-05 06:37

Reviewer performed review: 2019-10-14 01:51

Review time: 8 Days and 19 Hours

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY | LANGUAGE QUALITY | CONCLUSION | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS |
|---|---|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | Peer-Review: |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language | (High priority) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | polishing | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of | (General priority) | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not | language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript: |
| publish | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
| | | | Conflicts-of-Interest: |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes |
| | | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Comments for ESPS Manuscript NO 51737 This retrospective study is interesting and the text is well written, there are no major and few minor concerns. Regarding the latter: some sentences are too long and hence hindering understanding of the readers. For example, Page 17, Section –Conclusions, Lines 6-9 : “this study showed that achieving profound TN rather than complete pathological response by loco-regional therapy could also offer better outcomes for patients undergoing LDLT for HCC providing additional information to optimize therapeutic strategies for patients with HCC.” Please check the similar long sentences and correct them in full text.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No