

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 51752

**Title:** Novel methylation panel genes in adjacent normal tissues predicts poor prognosis of colorectal cancer in Taiwan

**Reviewer's code:** 03806663

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Assistant Professor

**Reviewer's country:** Egypt

**Author's country:** Taiwan

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jie Wang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-11-05 12:46

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-11-07 11:23

**Review time:** 1 Day and 22 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

the topic of this issue is interesting, but some comments are highlighted below: 1-the number of cases is small. 2- it is a retrospective study. 3- still these biomarkers depend on human tissue. 4- is the use of nearby normal tissue afeasible one for comparison i.e there may be a change in the genetic analysis in those patients.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 51752

**Title:** Novel methylation panel genes in adjacent normal tissues predicts poor prognosis of colorectal cancer in Taiwan

**Reviewer's code:** 00536689

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Assistant Professor

**Reviewer's country:** Italy

**Author's country:** Taiwan

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jie Wang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-12-02 10:15

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-12-02 10:20

**Review time:** 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

I read the manuscript very carefully. The topic is very interesting. Many scientific studies try to identify risk factors and prognostic factors in patients with malignant colorectal cancer. The work is well conducted. The population object of the study is conspicuous. The results are interesting and well exposed.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 51752

**Title:** Novel methylation panel genes in adjacent normal tissues predicts poor prognosis of colorectal cancer in Taiwan

**Reviewer's code:** 00052899

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Chief Doctor, Director, Professor

**Reviewer's country:** China

**Author's country:** Taiwan

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jie Wang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-12-04 12:42

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-12-04 15:44

**Review time:** 3 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The present paper by Hsu CH et al investigated the prognostic value of a panel of methylated genes in colorectal cancer. The study may facilitate approaching novel strategies to improve the prognosis of colorectal cancer. Several major points should be further addressed by the authors: 1. Represented results of methylation-specific PCR in tumor tissues and normal tissues should be shown. 2. A recently published paper by the authors (Int J Mol Sci. 2019;20(19). pii: E4672) was quite similar in study design, but different methylated genes were selected for examination. The authors need to further address the rationale for candidate gene selection. 3. How was the cutoff number of aberrant methylated genes determined? Why the patients were divided into two groups at 3 aberrancy? 4. What are the area under the ROC curve (AUROC), positive predictive value (PPV) and negative predictive value (NPV) of the methylation panel in predicting the prognosis of colorectal cancer? 5. Was the prognostic performance of the methylation panel superior to the TNM staging system? The comparison should be made. 6. Subtitles are recommended for the Results section.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No