



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 51752

Title: Novel methylation panel genes in adjacent normal tissues predicts poor prognosis of colorectal cancer in Taiwan

Reviewer’s code: 03806663

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Assistant Professor

Reviewer’s country: Egypt

Author’s country: Taiwan

Reviewer chosen by: Jie Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-11-05 12:46

Reviewer performed review: 2019-11-07 11:23

Review time: 1 Day and 22 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

the topic of this issue is interesting, but some comments are highlighted below: 1-the number of cases is small. 2- it is a retrospective study. 3- still these biomarkers depend on human tissue. 4- is the use of nearby normal tissue afeasible one for comparison i.e there may be a change in the genetic analysis in those patients.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 51752

Title: Novel methylation panel genes in adjacent normal tissues predicts poor prognosis of colorectal cancer in Taiwan

Reviewer's code: 00536689

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Assistant Professor

Reviewer's country: Italy

Author's country: Taiwan

Reviewer chosen by: Jie Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-12-02 10:15

Reviewer performed review: 2019-12-02 10:20

Review time: 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

I read the manuscript very carefully. The topic is very interesting. Many scientific studies try to identify risk factors and prognostic factors in patients with malignant colorectal cancer. The work is well conducted. The population object of the study is conspicuous. The results are interesting and well exposed.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 51752

Title: Novel methylation panel genes in adjacent normal tissues predicts poor prognosis of colorectal cancer in Taiwan

Reviewer’s code: 00052899

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Chief Doctor, Director, Professor

Reviewer’s country: China

Author’s country: Taiwan

Reviewer chosen by: Jie Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-12-04 12:42

Reviewer performed review: 2019-12-04 15:44

Review time: 3 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

The present paper by Hsu CH et al investigated the prognostic value of a panel of methylated genes in colorectal cancer. The study may facilitate approaching novel strategies to improve the prognosis of colorectal cancer. Several major points should be further addressed by the authors: 1. Represented results of methylation-specific PCR in tumor tissues and normal tissues should be shown. 2. A recently published paper by the authors (Int J Mol Sci. 2019;20(19). pii: E4672) was quite similar in study design, but different methylated genes were selected for examination. The authors need to further address the rationale for candidate gene selection. 3. How was the cutoff number of aberrant methylated genes determined? Why the patients were divided into two groups at 3 aberrancy? 4. What are the area under the ROC curve (AUROC), positive predictive value (PPV) and negative predictive value (NPV) of the methylation panel in predicting the prognosis of colorectal cancer? 5. Was the prognostic performance of the methylation panel superior to the TNM staging system? The comparison should be made. 6. Subtitles are recommended for the Results section.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No