



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 51778

**Title:** Prognostic value of preoperative weight loss adjusted body mass index on survival after esophagectomy for esophageal squamous cell carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 03647716

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Academic Research, Assistant Professor, Surgeon

**Reviewer's country:** Italy

**Author's country:** China

**Manuscript submission date:** 2019-10-09

**Reviewer chosen by:** Artificial Intelligence Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-10-12 09:38

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-10-12 09:49

**Review time:** 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://www.wjgnet.com**

### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This is an interesting an well-designed study on the impact of BMI performing an esopahgectomy

### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

#### *Google Search:*

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

#### *BPG Search:*

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 51778

**Title:** Prognostic value of preoperative weight loss adjusted body mass index on survival after esophagectomy for esophageal squamous cell carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 00503176

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Professor

**Reviewer's country:** Croatia

**Author's country:** China

**Manuscript submission date:** 2019-10-09

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jie Wang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-12-02 09:21

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-12-02 09:52

**Review time:** 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://www.wjgnet.com**

## **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The authors conducted a well planned, logical and "gradual" analysis of the data taking into account the important elements. The manuscript is well written and presented. Limitations are adequately addressed. In the abstract - there is just one typing error (CONCLUDION..- should be CONCLUSION). The only (minor) comment - one of the exclusion criteria was "incomplete data". Incomplete data - as a reason for exclusion is known to possibly include selection bias. Hence, I believe that an additional chart (supplemental or in the main manuscript) should be provided showing: a) how many subjects were initially considered; b) how many were NOT INCLUDED - because of (i) non-squamous ca; (ii) incidental finding of M1 stage during surgery; (iii) receiving neoadjuvant and (iv) "incomplete data". If there is a substantial proportion of those with "incomplete data" (vs. all considered), e.g., >10% - then (I presume that "Incomplete" refers to not having data on PWL/BMI mainly, maybe tumor stage, but less likely) - median OS should be reported for this subcohort. By this virtue, the authors would add additional strength to the evidence they provided.

## **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

### *Google Search:*

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

### *BPG Search:*

- The same title



# Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](https://www.wjgnet.com)

Duplicate publication

Plagiarism

No



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 51778

**Title:** Prognostic value of preoperative weight loss adjusted body mass index on survival after esophagectomy for esophageal squamous cell carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 00724492

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Doctor

**Reviewer's country:** Turkey

**Author's country:** China

**Manuscript submission date:** 2019-10-09

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jie Wang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-12-02 04:49

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-12-09 18:31

**Review time:** 7 Days and 13 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://www.wjgnet.com**

### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Dear Author, This research article is well written and add our knowledge in literature.

### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

#### *Google Search:*

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

#### *BPG Search:*

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No