

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 51778

Title: Prognostic value of preoperative weight loss adjusted body mass index on survival after esophagectomy for esophageal squamous cell carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 03647716

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Academic Research, Assistant Professor, Surgeon

Reviewer's country: Italy

Author's country: China

Manuscript submission date: 2019-10-09

Reviewer chosen by: Artificial Intelligence Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-10-12 09:38

Reviewer performed review: 2019-10-12 09:49

Review time: 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting an well-designed study on the impact of BMI performing an esopahgectomy

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 51778

Title: Prognostic value of preoperative weight loss adjusted body mass index on survival after esophagectomy for esophageal squamous cell carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 00503176

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's country: Croatia

Author's country: China

Manuscript submission date: 2019-10-09

Reviewer chosen by: Jie Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-12-02 09:21

Reviewer performed review: 2019-12-02 09:52

Review time: 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors conducted a well planned, logical and "gradual" analysis of the data taking into account the important elements. The manuscript is well written and presented. Limitations are adequately addressed. In the abstract - there is just one typing error (CONCLUDION..- should be CONCLUSION). The only (minor) comment - one of the exclusion criteria was "incomplete data". Incomplete data - as a reason for exclusion is known to possibly include selection bias. Hence, I believe that an additional chart (supplemental or in the main manuscript) should be provided showing: a) how many subjects were initially considered; b) how many were NOT INCLUDED - because of (i) non-squamous ca; (ii) incidental finding of M1 stage during surgery; (iii) receiving neoadjuvant and (iv) "incomplete data". If there is a substantial proportion of those with "incomplete data" (vs. all considered), e.g., >10% - then (I presume that "Incomplete" refers to not having data on PWL/BMI mainly, maybe tumor stage, but less likely) - median OS should be reported for this subcohort. By this virtue, the authors would add additional strength to the evidence they provided.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

[] Duplicate publication

[] Plagiarism

[Y] No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 51778

Title: Prognostic value of preoperative weight loss adjusted body mass index on survival after esophagectomy for esophageal squamous cell carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 00724492

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Author's country: China

Manuscript submission date: 2019-10-09

Reviewer chosen by: Jie Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-12-02 04:49

Reviewer performed review: 2019-12-09 18:31

Review time: 7 Days and 13 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Author, This research article is well written and add our knowledge in literature.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No