

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 51925

Title: Trends in treatment and overall survival among patients with proximal esophageal cancer: a population-based study

Reviewer's code: 03251421

Position: Editor-in-Chief

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's country: China

Author's country: Netherlands

Reviewer chosen by: Artificial Intelligence Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-10-19 03:37

Reviewer performed review: 2019-10-19 09:12

Review time: 5 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. I am not sure if it is solid to claim "Survival has significantly improved in non-metastatic proximal esophageal cancer, which was associated with an increased use of chemoradiation. Overall survival and treatment patterns for metastatic disease did not change significantly over time.". It is hard to say that the baseline is even during different periods. Statisticians must be consulted. 2, Also this manuscript only recorded the treatment such as chemotherapy and radiotherapy. Detailed information such as the specific regime or dose for chemotherapy and radiotherapy is not recorded. These information may also effect the final conclusion.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 51925

Title: Trends in treatment and overall survival among patients with proximal esophageal cancer: a population-based study

Reviewer's code: 03262700

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Staff Physician

Reviewer's country: United States

Author's country: Netherlands

Reviewer chosen by: Artificial Intelligence Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-10-16 14:50

Reviewer performed review: 2019-10-26 03:41

Review time: 9 Days and 12 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I would like to thank authors for conducting this population-based retrospective study to evaluate the change in the treatment trend and survival of the cervical and upper thoracic esophageal cancer. The article is well written. Although the idea of the study is not completely novel and we have seen other similar studies, the body of literature still needs more information focused on patients with proximal esophageal cancers and in line with that this study is helping to fill the current knowledge gap. Comment: 1- Overall survival has been defined as the time from diagnosis to death from ANY cause. The risk of this definition is that it does not differentiate between cancer-related or cancer-unrelated causes of death. This becomes more challenging when we are drawing our conclusion across the "time" axis. As a matter of fact, we know that, for instance, ischemic heart disease is the leading cause of death globally (Lancet. 2018;392:1736-1788) and there has been a significant improvement in the treatment of such disorders, hence survival benefit, since 1989; same story for diabetes, infections, etc. Therefore, the possibility of survival benefit secondary to treatment of disorders not-directly related to cancer should be discussed as well. To address this issue, either a subgroup analysis based on the cause of death should be added to the paper, or if data is not available, this needs to be mentioned as a significant limitation with the possibility of confounding the survival benefit as one of the major outcomes of the study. 2-If data is available, it will be helpful to know about major risk factors of esophageal cancer such as smoking status and alcohol use, and that if such factors had any affect on such a patient population's survival. Thank you.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

☐ Plagiarism

☐ No

BPG Search:

☐ The same title

☐ Duplicate publication

☐ Plagiarism

☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 51925

Title: Trends in treatment and overall survival among patients with proximal esophageal cancer: a population-based study

Reviewer's code: 02904481

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MSc

Professional title: Associate Professor, Chief Doctor

Reviewer's country: China

Author's country: Netherlands

Reviewer chosen by: Artificial Intelligence Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-10-20 04:14

Reviewer performed review: 2019-10-27 23:18

Review time: 7 Days and 19 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

This is an interesting manuscript focusing on trends in treatment and overall survival among patients with proximal esophageal cancer r. The text is strictly logical. The detailed schemes of surgery, CRT and endoscopic resection should be described.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No