



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Meta-Analysis

Manuscript NO: 52097

Title: L-carnitine supplementation in non-alcoholic fatty liver disease: A systematic review and meta-analysis

Reviewer's code: 00607640

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Author's country: United Kingdom

Manuscript submission date: 2019-10-22

Reviewer chosen by: Jie Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-11-04 17:44

Reviewer performed review: 2019-11-07 12:52

Review time: 2 Days and 19 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors reviewed randomised trials reporting effects of dietary L-carnitine supplementation in non-alcoholic fatty liver disease. The literatures cited in the manuscript are convincing and valuable. The conclusion is insightful, and could be helpful in clinic study. In overall, this review manuscript is well organized and is highly recommend.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- [] The same title
- [] Duplicate publication
- [] Plagiarism
- [Y] No

BPG Search:

- [] The same title
- [] Duplicate publication
- [] Plagiarism
- [Y] No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Meta-Analysis

Manuscript NO: 52097

Title: L-carnitine supplementation in non-alcoholic fatty liver disease: A systematic review and meta-analysis

Reviewer's code: 00227368

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor, Professor

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Author's country: United Kingdom

Manuscript submission date: 2019-10-22

Reviewer chosen by: Jie Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-11-24 09:17

Reviewer performed review: 2019-11-24 09:19

Review time: 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Not goog enough analysis

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Meta-Analysis

Manuscript NO: 52097

Title: L-carnitine supplementation in non-alcoholic fatty liver disease: A systematic review and meta-analysis

Reviewer's code: 03293832

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Senior Research Fellow

Reviewer's country: Japan

Author's country: United Kingdom

Manuscript submission date: 2019-10-22

Reviewer chosen by: Jie Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-11-25 07:58

Reviewer performed review: 2019-11-28 06:42

Review time: 2 Days and 22 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript reviews systemically the randomized trials of investigating the effects of dietary L-carnitine supplementation on liver biochemistry, liver fat and insulin sensitivity in NAFLD and performs meta-analysis. The contents are well-written and meta-analysis is performed properly. I suggest that the manuscript is acceptable in the World Journal of Gastroenterology.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Meta-Analysis

Manuscript NO: 52097

Title: L-carnitine supplementation in non-alcoholic fatty liver disease: A systematic review and meta-analysis

Reviewer's code: 00008577

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Associate Professor, Professor

Reviewer's country: Italy

Author's country: United Kingdom

Manuscript submission date: 2019-10-22

Reviewer chosen by: Jie Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-11-07 05:31

Reviewer performed review: 2019-12-01 16:30

Review time: 24 Days and 10 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> General
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors have performed a meta-analysis about the role of L-Carnitine for the treatment of NAFLD. The meta-analysis, from the methodological point of view, is well conducted. The selection criteria of the studies and analyses were rigorously carried out. Furthermore, the authors correctly mention all the limits of the work. However, I have many doubts about the usefulness of a meta-analytical work for the following reasons:

1. includes only 5 studies (for a total of 338 patients) which, as also indicated by the authors, 3 are of poor methodological quality (inadequate randomization or of dubious correctness).
2. The only significant outcome is the reduction of ALT (ASTs are not significant), which however also presents a high heterogeneity between studies. This ALT reduction is, in my opinion, not sufficient to speculate a favorable effect on NAFLD while the authors consider this outcome relevant and build their discussion on this topic.
3. As far as steatosis reduction is concerned, I believe it is difficult to give adequate information because in 2 studies with ultrasound L-Carnitine has no effects, while for the remaining 2 (1 with histology and 1 with CT) the steatosis is reduced but few patients are enrolled and the studies are badly done and very heterogeneous.
4. The studies are also heterogeneous with regard to duration of therapy, formulation of L-Carnitine and dose. Therefore it is difficult to establish which is the correct dosage of supplementation to propose.
5. Finally, Carnitine is mainly contained in red meat, and has been associated in numerous studies published in TOP journals (J Am Heart Assoc. 2019 May 7; 8 (9): e011037; Atherosclerosis. 2016 Apr; 247: 64-9 ; Nature Medicine 2013; 19: 576-585) to increase atherosclerosis and cardio-vascular events, through its metabolism in TMAO mediated by intestinal microbiota. Even postulating that L-Carnitine can reduce steatosis and hepatic inflammation, it is difficult to propose the treatment for patients who have cardiovascular disease as their primary cause of



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

morbidity and mortality. The authors have not addressed this problem at all.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No