PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 52299

Title: Diagnostic and clinical significance of antigen-specific pancreatic antibodies in inflammatory bowel diseases: a meta-analysis

Reviewer's code: 01587796

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's country: United States

Author's country: Greece

Reviewer chosen by: Artificial Intelligence Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-11-03 13:58

Reviewer performed review: 2019-11-08 21:33

Review time: 5 Days and 7 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	[ ] Accept (High priority)	Peer-Review:
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[Y] Accept (General priority)	[ ] Anonymous
[ ] Grade C: Good			[Y] Onymous
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Minor revision	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
[ ] Grade E: Do not publish	[ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Major revision	[ ] Advanced
		[ ] Rejection	[Y] General
			[ ] No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			[ ] Yes
			[Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1

This meta-analysis is remarkably thorough and meticulous. The conclusion that anti-GP2 is not an ideal diagnostic marker of CD seems justified. If my interpretation of Table 4 is not oversimplified, it seems to me that it could be interpreted as hypothetically showing that 98-99% of all positive tests are false positives! If this observation is correct, then it should perhaps be emphasized more strongly in the Abstract and the text.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[   ] The same title

[   ] Duplicate publication

[   ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[   ] The same title

[   ] Duplicate publication

[   ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 52299

Title: Diagnostic and clinical significance of antigen-specific pancreatic antibodies in inflammatory bowel diseases: a meta-analysis

Reviewer's code: 03254999

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: FACG, MD

Professional title: Associate Professor, Attending Doctor

Reviewer's country: United States

Author's country: Greece

Reviewer chosen by: Jin-Zhou Tang

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-11-09 16:15

Reviewer performed review: 2019-11-09 16:21

Review time: 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	[ ] Accept (High priority)	Peer-Review:
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[Y] Accept (General priority)	[Y] Anonymous
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Minor revision	[ ] Onymous
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Major revision	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
[ ] Grade E: Do not publish		[ ] Rejection	[ ] Advanced
			[Y] General
			[ ] No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			[ ] Yes
			[Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a great meta-analysis looking at the utility of biomarkers for the diagnosis of CD, specifically Anti-GP2. The specificity of this test of 97% is exceptional. The authors' caution is appreciated in recommending wide-spread use of this test, mainly because of it's low sensitivity. This study does, however, really support a potential utility for its very high negative predictive value.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[   ] The same title

[   ] Duplicate publication

[   ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[   ] The same title

[   ] Duplicate publication

[   ] Plagiarism

[Y] No